

Temporary Places of a New Sociability











This handbook was funded by the European Union's Rights, Equality and Citizenship Programme (2014-2020)

The content of this handbook represents the views of the author only and is his/her sole responsibility.

The European Commission does not accept any responsibility for use that may be made of the information it contains.

Rijeka 2020 – European Capital of Culture

September, 2020

NTRO Lela Vujanić: Welcome to a table where everything is shared, but heated discussions happen much more often than a peaceful lunch	4
FURIOZA CYCLE Control of the set of the set	12
RoUm ••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••	26
REVIEW OF SMALL LITERATURES & THE FESTIVAL OF THE EUROPEAN SHORT STORY Dunja Matić Benčić: When you have a revolution on one side and the preservation of heritage on the other, the best thing to do is "mix the ngredients"	38
FIFTH ENSEMBLE ••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••	50
PORTO ETNO ••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••	60
SMOQUA ••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••	76
RISK CHANGE ••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••	90
LIBERATED RIJEKA ••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••	110
DIVERSITY MIXER ••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••	124
WHO COOKED	136
MPRINT ••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••	140



Welcome to a table where everything : LELA VUJANIC is shared...

I

flagships of the Rijeka 2020 – European Capital of Culture project. It has dealt with minorities and migration in various areas of culture and social life, for the most part in cooperation with Rijeka's minority communities and social groups. It was cooking in the cultural life of the city from 2017 to 2020, trying to create new social spaces based on solidarity, mainly through its two major themes. They are minorities and migration, two themes that heavily influenced Rijeka's past, and that continue to define its present as a multicultural, port city, often characterised by dramatic immigration and emigration. These are themes that also identify the European present, and from the viewpoint of the contemporary rise of right-wing and neo-fascist politics, they also determine the political future of the entire continent.

The Kitchen of Diversity is one of the seven

By saying we have been dealing with migrations, we mean **dealing with** humanity at large, and its searches of a better life through contemporary interdisciplinary art, activist collectives and

initiatives. And by saying we have been dealing with minorities and minority identities, we mean to say we have been dealing with the heritage and identities imposed on us by birth, but also the identities we ourselves choose, those we want to embrace, as well as the future, new communities we create, take part in, and to which we want to belong.

The *Kitchen* was made possible in cooperation with a variety of social groups and communities, members of the Pensioners' Association, gays, lesbians, the Roma, national minorities of city of Rijeka, children and young people with developmental disabilities, with all those who, due to their age, gender or ethnicity, (socially constructed) disability, social class, i.e. social status, are considered to be other and different. Within the framework of the Fifth Ensemble where this different linguistic and semantic use has in fact been established, we like to call them the differently abled. The Kitchen does not recognise the limitations of a given genre, or the dichotomies of high and low culture, amateurism and professionalism, ethics and aesthetics, art and activism, but it sovereignly treads the different areas of culture and social life, which consequentially means that the *Kitchen* involved programmes from the fields of literature, music, visual and performing arts, social entrepreneurship, cultural policies, gastronomy, most of which propagate the common underlying idea that the imposed dualities mentioned above need to be transcended in favour of the survival of culture and even more so, the survival of the community.

...but heated discussions happen much more often than a peaceful lunch

Encounters of authentic voices

Sometimes the *Kitchen* literally had us cooking. Yet, it is not a restaurant, which was the first thought of many when I would tell them that I run a *Kitchen*; it was conceived as a metaphor of the common table, a place where stories, habits and prejudices are shared. Or at least that is what the official programme description at the Rijeka 2020 – ECoC website¹. But the *Kitchen*, and even more so, the table have in fact proven to be a place of gathering and story sharing. However, this common table is not always the conciliatory table of a quiet bourgeois lunch, at times it tends to be a table of heated discussions, clashes of ideologies, of battles of hegemonic narratives, a table you sometimes get up from and leave. Along the same lines, it is not always the happy faces of migrants that are seated at this table, whose ethnic kitchens make them less foreign, less other to the domicile population. Sometimes it is an empty table as the happy faces are in actual fact dead bodies in the Mediterranean, forming a part of a Caucasian woman's nightmare, waking her up from a dream while she's spending her middle-class vacation at that same

Mediterranean². The *Kitchen* is therefore as much a place of encounters and recognition, as of conflicts and of difficult topics we too often like to turn a blind eye on due to our numbness and inability.

This *Kitchen* of ours does not feature clean lines and architectural forms but is in many ways messy. It has seen experiments, trials, errors and starting over, scattering and

7

spilling. Not everyone who was part of the *Kitchen* was of one mind, which is evident even in the texts found in this publication. The purpose of the *Kitchen* is to let everyone voice their authentic selves, and to help different social groups and identities, particularly the non-dominant and traditionally marginalised ones, those who are always missing from the table, get their own safe place and a voice, not only in the sense of representation, but also in the sense of their full participation in cultural production. This Kitchen allowed the Roma people to become upcycle design mentors at the Academy of Fine Arts and gave individuals with developmental disabilities the opportunity to act on

¹ The Kitchen of Diversity flagship at the Rijeka 2020 website. https://rijeka2020.eu/program/kuhinja-razlicitosti/

² The work of Lana Čmajčanin and Olga Dimitrijević "A Change is Gonna Come", showcased at the Risk Change exhibition "The Escape" at the Museum of Modern and Contemporary Art Rijeka in 2019.

the stage of the national theatre. In this endeavour we wanted to keep expanding the horizon of participation in culture by including the diverse and at times atypical producers (atypical because it is only within the *Kitchen* programmes that they became cultural workers, and sometimes even artists), and by trying to reach out to the equally diverse audiences as future producers of cultural programmes. **Our** role model in the political sense were the authentic traditions and experiences from this region, the philosophy of care as developed through the Women's Antifascist Front, and the policy of camaraderie and hospitality as practiced within the Non-Aligned Movement. In her analysis of the impotence of the states and the deterioration of the democratic system the philosopher Rada Iveković³ has this to say: feminists need allies in their joint venture, and she sees these allies precisely in migrants and the associations connected

to them. Similarly, Paul B. Preciado says,

Kassel), that our common parliament is in

ruins and that the real one is found in the

streets, constituted of unrepresented and

of economic austerity and xenophobic

our work.

undocumented bodies that reject measures

politics. With the *Kitchen* project, we tried

to let all these experiences, our history and

modern anticolonial movements guide us in

in his title text⁴ of the Public Programs

of documenta 14 (held in Athens and

Ν

т

R

0

8

Our goal was also to rediscover Rijeka and its exceptional locations for audiences coming both from the region and from the city itself, and to initiate a new kind of imagination regarding the utilisation of the formerly bustling factory halls and full port warehouses that today sit eerily empty. In a city that, in the crevice of its inability to contemplate its own future. was plagued by the fugue⁵, to paraphrase Daša Drndić. So, within the Furioza Cycle, a programme initiated in 2018, we showcased the music created by furious women, and this was done in the locations of the so-called industrial heritage, the Hartera paper factory, former Ivex and Exportdrvo, while our plan in 2020 was to temporarily occupy the HŽ (Croatian Railways) turntable (by showcasing Afrofuturism as artistic movement), and the INA (Croatian oil and gas company) complex (by presenting Holly Herndon and her interdependent music protocols), both of which can be found in what used to be called Industrijska ulica (Industrial Street). Metropolis, the wellknown port warehouses, which were named thus by the conservators, after the film of the same name by Fritz Lang, and are now closed to the public, remain an unfulfilled wish, passed on to some other initiatives and collectives of Rijeka.

The *Kitchen*'s programmes have been woven into the fabric of Rijeka since 2017. Some of them were already outlined in

the Bid book of Rijeka 2020, and others were initiated along the way, in response to what we perceived as a need of the city. such as the lack of its concert and clubbing backbone, or of connections between the old and young antifascists, i.e. In other words, it was a response to the needs of the local scenes themselves, as was the case with the Smogua Festival, or a response to new suggestions in cooperation with local and national organisations and initiatives that dealt with topics in line with the flagship. Virtually all of the programmes outlined in this publication followed a regular annual rhythm, and in 2020 all of them should have had their grand finale, by becoming more complex, more international, showing themselves to the rest of Croatia and Europe in their full glory, after years of hard work, honing, and purification of the programme concepts and cultural and artistic practices. Yet, 2020. was an unexpectedly surprising year, and that's an understatement.

And it started out so nice, says the curator of another programme closely related to *Kitchen*, Empeduja Art camp⁶, Mara Anjoli Vujić, probably alluding to the grandiose, antifascist opening ceremony of Rijeka 2020 – European Capital of Culture organised in the tradition of avant-garde theatre on 1 February at the port basin. It should have been the year when a Croatian city would, for the first time ever, proudly bear the coveted title, a year when all the eyes are on Rijeka and Croatia, including on their local scenes and their cultural sector

as a whole. In a totally unexpected anticlimax, however, it is a year that will be remembered by closed museums, libraries, theatres, cancelled festivals, concerts and international touring events. It is a year when culture was one of the sectors most affected by the COVID-19 crisis, which further deepened and accelerated its existing vulnerability, and brought the issues of labour and participation, of the sustainability of our practices and of the sector as a whole to the forefront. The crisis has also had a dramatic impact on the ECoC project and its programmes have suffered significant reductions. Nonetheless, many of the programmes were implemented successfully, albeit to a lesser extent. Far more important than the partial (un)fulfilment of the programme in 2020 is its future, as well as the future of the producers of the programme, collaborations established and new narratives that the citizens of Rijeka tell of themselves. Despite of its bitter and unexpected lessons, the crisis has taught us something. It has shown that the hyperproduction of events and construction of objects should be replaced by more new and more supportive relations, sustainability and the long-term nature of our work and practices.

Ultimately, the main question asked by the *Kitchen* as well as the wider political community, which has definitely remained unanswered, was this: How are we going to live together? And while our colleagues from Sweet & Salt, another ECoC flagship, centred their presentation of Croatia at this year's Venice

³ Munjin, Bojan; Iveković, Rada. "Women everywhere are the first saviours of refugees". Novosti, online edition, 30 July 2019, accessed on 14 September 2020. https://www.portalnovosti.com/rada-ivekovi%C4%87-zene-susvuda-prve-spasiteljice-izbjeglih

⁴ Preciado, Paul B. "The Parliament of Bodies". *Documenta 14*, website, 2017. Accessed on 14 September 2020. https://www.documenta14.de/en/public-programs/

⁵ Drndić, Daša. *Leica Format*. Zagreb: Meandar, 2003.

⁶ Anjoli Vujić, Mara. "And the year started out so nice". 6th Art Camp Epmeduja, Rijeka: Novi turizam d.o.o., 2020.

Biennale of Architecture around this very topic. at *Kitchen* we tried to answer this question by establishing some new relations, outlining new spaces, and by broadening the areas of inclusion and struggle. It can't hurt to remind ourselves of identities and migration, emphasizing what Preciado says in another of his texts: "We need a parliament not defined in terms of the politics of identity or nationality: a parliament of (vulnerable) bodies living on planet Earth"⁷. And the vulnerable ones, migrants in particular, are all around us, knocking on our door, charging their mobile phones in our cafes, resting in our holiday homes (or as many of the media like to report, breaking and entering them). The only thing that needs to be done to begin with, is to not look away.

I

Authors from the inside and views from the outside

The texts contained in this publication were partly written by authors who were both the partakers and the producers of the programmes, and partly by those with a view from the outside, thus historicising and contextualising the themes and scenes of *Kitchen*. The texts are complemented with short pieces of information on the actual *Kitchen of Diversity* programmes that were implemented in Rijeka from 2017 to 2020. **Be it due to the lack of space or due to overlapping topics, some of the programmes haven't made their way into** this publication, such as Unreal Cities, Migrant Days, and the seven-day promotion of the flagship in Belgrade, which doesn't mean that they are inferior or less kitchenrelated in any way. You can take a closer look at the list of all those who cooked in this Kitchen at the end of this publication.

In a text by Ivana Franić entitled "Furious women and new, solidarity protocols for saving the music industry", you can read about women in music and the wider context of this sector's development, from peer-to-peer services and festivalisation enabled by affordable flights to a pandemic that made all these trends redundant. Franko Dota thematises the development of LGBTIQ+ activism and the culturalisation of its practices in Croatia and particularly Rijeka, where a lesbian organisation Lorice is celebrating two decades of its existence in 2020, along with the fourth anniversary of the Smoqua International Festival of Queer and Feminist Culture, while Tamara Puhovski in her text entitled "How art saves the Roma and how they in turn save art" documents all the developmental phases of a new community comprised of artists and Roma people, and of a process where the Roma themselves have become artists and mentors, despite having been somewhat unwilling and shy about it at first. Porto Etno - Festival of World Music and Gastronomy, initiated in 2017 and produced by Rijeka 2020, whose origins can be traced to an event with a twenty-year tradition, where Rijeka's national minorities – 21 of them to be precise, presented their culture, inspired Hajrudin Hromadžić to critically

examine the concepts of cultural diversity and identity policies, and of the ideological setbacks of the entire ECoC project in his text entitled "Minority Others: in the gap between the exotics of the object and the voice of the subject". Nataša Antulov, in her text entitled "The body we need to save our right to decent work, as well as the theatre" gives her reflections on the bringing together of the Fifth Ensemble, an art collective of differently abled young people who create an exciting and inclusive performing art. Dunja Matić Benčić deals with minority literature with a review of the *Kitchen's* literary programmes, the Review of Small Literatures and the Festival of the European Short Story, while Marina Tkalčić summarises the four-year history of the Risk Change programme, and brings interviews with two contemporary artists who link their work to existing, but in the human and political sense, unrecognised communities and individuals. In the text on the Diversity *Mixer* project, we try to find a place within the field of cultural policy for all the cultural and artistic practices of the Kitchen flagship, but also to provide some guidelines and recommendations for the future of public financing of culture. Liberated Rijeka, our "small" antifa programme, has inspired

Milena Ostojić to problematise modern antifascism in Croatia, its relation to Real politics in domestic and European terms, and the grassroots practices. The author places modern antifascism viewed through the lens of the policies and practices of solidarity into the context of migration, and together with Pia Klemp, the captain of several rescue vessels in the Mediterranean, most recently of one named "Louise Michel", concludes that rescuing migrants cannot be viewed as a humanitarian action, but as part of a broader anti-fascist fight.

With these words we are also closing the "restaurant" named *Kitchen*. ■

⁷ Preciado, Paul B. "Learning from the Virus". *Artforum*, May-June 2020.



The Furioza Cycle, initiated in 2018 as a programme of the Kitchen of Diversity flagship, has showcased music by women at select locations throughout Rijeka. It has turned gender stereotypes on its head by showcasing female songwriters that challenge the area within which they work, push the boundaries of what it means to be female and set new standards, while not being confined in terms of genre, since its concerts have encompassed post-punk, gothic, indie rock and avant-garde techno, and bringing together female musicians that redefine entrenched norms and expand musical horizons by constructing new and exciting worlds.

Furioza is aimed at "those of us here, those who have just moved here and those visiting as tourists, looking for a different kind of city" and attempts to allow the audience from the region to rediscover Rijeka and its stunning, yet unused locations, particularly those that belong to the city's rich industrial heritage, such as Ivex, Exportdrvo and Hartera.

A plethora of Croatian and international female musicians have performed at the event, such as Punčke (HR), Ana Antonova (HR), Chelsea Wolfe (US), Brutus (BE), Rrose (USA), Inga Mauer (RU), Anna Calvi (UK), Mary May (HR), Dr. Rubinstein (RU), Elena Colombi (IT) and Kasja (HR), while many other women, including journalists, camerawomen, web designers, event organisers, high school girls, pensioners etc. have been involved in the production of the cycle.

FURIONS women and new, solidarity protocols for saving the music industry : IVNA FRANK

By drawing attention to the necessity of making certain overall changes in the global social and economic order, the current pandemic and consequential crisis have unearthed a slew of issues that have been systematically plaguing the music industry since at least the turn of the millennium and the panic over p2p services for sharing digital audio files. The subsequent early enthusiasm surrounding new and widely available streaming platforms quickly subsided when it came to light that the currently dominant models of music consumptions are unfair and unprofitable to mid-and lower-tier musicians and that they have unfavourably influenced music production by favouring easy-listening playlists and stimulating the writing of intentionally generic music tailored to the aforementioned playlists or by releasing unnecessarily extensive albums in an

attempt for to countervail the low streaming revenues for musicians. The only remaining source of profit for a significant portion of contemporary artists are tours and live gigs, which has made the pressing issue at hand alarming due to the tangible and physical inability to hold regular concerts and parties.

F

U

R

L

0

Ζ

Α

15

С

Υ

С

L

Е

The future of live music has already been somewhat jeopardised by the proliferation of various music festivals, which rely on the, until recently, ironclad option to host large gatherings, as well as on safe and fast international travel. As Chal Ravens mentions in her article "2010-19: Rise of the Festival-Industrial Complex"⁸ available on Resident Advisor, which she wrote prior to the global pandemic that would become a gamechanger, the recent rise of festivals has been significantly buoyed by the "golden age of budget flights". According to Ravens, this is a luxury that could soon be cut short due to climate change awareness, since some festivals have already started pleading with their fans to come by bus instead of plane, if possible, or have been devising brand new formats.

⁸ Chal, Ravens. "2010-19: Rise Of The Festival-Industrial Complex". *Resident Advisor*, online edition, 31 January 2020, accessed on 17 August 2020. https://www.residentadvisor.net/features/3595

Environmentally conscious or not, now everyone is forced to stream online live performances without anyone in attendance. Yet changes are progressing at a much slower rate than expected, which has prompted a majority of the festivals scheduled for the next season to indefatigably announce new guests and promote ticket sales. This is symptomatic of the modern music industry and it is somewhat reminiscent

of the famous Internet meme, which

depicts a dog sitting in a burning house

and saying "this is fine". Music industry workers, from musicians and agents to roadies, most of whom have already found themselves in a very precarious situation, have been reminded by the global pandemic that in addition to album sales generating almost no profit, sometimes not securing enough gigs to make a living, paychecks arriving late or not at all, there is also the

possibility that touring will have to be

put on hold for a while – so long, in fact, that many of them will probably have to find new day jobs. Following years of struggle for the recognition of marginalised groups within the music scene, ranging from women and queer artists to non-white and non-Western musicians in general, the issue of underor inadequate representation, as well as pay-gaps, has been replaced by the complete revamping of outdated models on which the music industry rests as the latest hot topic.

Indie scene "atavism"

Certain "furious" women are at the forefront of public discussion on the problematic issues of the music industry as we know it and potential new models of development. For example, while her recent media outings have made the erstwhile indie heroine Grimes a mouthpiece for Silicon Valley's neoliberal technocrats, occupying the opposite side of the spectrum is the underground goth pop diva Zola Jesus, who has recently become quite vocal on social media, as well as the inevitable Holly Herndon, one of the most prominent contemporary musicians, whose music and public communication are focused on questioning the possibilities of new technologies and their political implications. Grimes' comment that human art is slowly coming to an end and Zola's subsequent accusation of privileged cynicism, has gradually evolved into an open dialogue on the unfounded panic surrounding generic AIcreated music, the democratisation

and opening of musical creations to new social strata and the potential of new technologies to transform the way in which we make and consume music.

Herndon and her partner and collaborator Mat Dryhurst are proponents of the so-called model of "interdependence" between various music scene protagonists, which should replace the independent music concept that has been idealised until now and which they consider an obsolete idea that encourages individualism but ultimately

facilitates the hegemonic tendencies of big record companies and streaming platforms.

E

F

U

R

0

Ζ

Α

17



In their opinion, the "indie" scene is beginning to look like a 20th-century atavism, ever since its appeal has been hijacked by streaming services in a perfidious attempt to exploit musicians. While it may be independent of large record companies, it has failed to escape the streaming giants.

Instead of "lending" music for peanuts on platforms like Spotify, the interdependence model advocates paying musicians directly for their releases via platforms such as Bandcamp, Patreon etc. This would allow performers to have an overview and control over their own contacts and to reach out to fans instead of constantly vying for their attention through promotional channels. By emphasising the virtues of solidarity, this model could, ideally, dismantle the myth of individual success, which is rooted in taking advantage of opportunities (and other people), and would transform the music scene into a living ecosystem as a substitute for the isolated one-on-one relationship between songwriter and fan. The distribution of profit among all collaborators, even in the sense of DJs compensating producers for appropriating their music, should stop perpetuating the myth of individual genius and compensation models, which ensure that the main act and big record companies reap all the profits.

According to the proponents of the interdependence model, the longevity and resilience of 21st-century music scenes is based on honouring history and understanding that institutions built on solid foundations allow individuals to succeed, as opposed to inherent talent that does not take class into consideration and, as such, should replace current individualist models, which drain artistic resources for short-term profit.

We should bear in mind that some of the most prominent stalwarts of this model, despite their broad world views and progressive stances - actually originate from the Western, neoliberal context, whose imagination seldom finds room for models that ultimately boil down to individual responsibility and direct financial exchange. Although the interdependence model soundly detects some of the flaws in the system, as well as the necessity and urgency to change its internal power structures, there are other perspectives that emphasise the need for other solutions. The critic Jes Skolnik points out that individual donations via, let's say, Patreon, can work on rare occasions, but that the "pool" of money is simply limited: by attempting to support each other, at the end of the day, "we all keep exchanging the same twenty dollars back and forth". Then there are technological activists, who traditionally believe that "information wants to be free" and modern music can also be viewed as a type of information in the digital age. But besides that, what about public funding models?

Taking on structural sexism

By being absent from the context of the United States or the UK to such an extent that they rarely find any advocates in the dominant Anglo-centric discourse on music, public funding models are more an exception to the rule than the rule itself in most of Europe. Although not necessarily associated exclusively with music festivals, but also with state aid for the production of music albums. local and international tours etc., which is provided in some countries, public funding has become a rare beacon of hope for electronic and experimental music in the last ten years due to the operation of a plethora of acknowledged music festivals. And not just in the economic sense.

The festival line-up, or the roster of selected performers, has long been a separate battlefield in the war against sexism in the music industry.

In addition to numerous media-published articles and pleas from female musicians and DJs for equality, initiatives, such as the Tumblr page Very Male Line-ups, have been consistent in calling out the tendency to fill festival line-ups with primarily (or exclusively!) male artists, without taking into consideration the influence of such line-ups on the position of vulnerable groups in the music industry. According to the latest annual survey conducted by the Female:Pressure "FACTS 2020" organisation⁹, some progress has been made after years of pressure and media campaigns advocating equality, but the discrepancy remains: the share of female artists at electronic music festivals rose from 9% in 2012 to 25% in 2019. Despite the positive trend, this still means that 65% of all featured festival performers are male artists.

Since 2017, the

С

Υ

С

L

Е

Female:Pressure survey has F posed some new questions, U R such as whether the festival Т has received public financial 0 aid or whether the directors Ζ are male or female. Α The data obtained over the course of three years indicates that publicly 20

funded festivals and festivals with female art directors have a proportionally larger number of female artists in the festival line-up, which is to be expected, considering the fact that public tenders often insist on encouraging diversity, which forces some festivals to put additional effort into piecing together a more balanced line-up. Be that as it may, active control of more or less popular festivals has proved to be a fertile ground for changing the system and a relevant means of combating structural sexism.

Promoting diversity is not the only area in which publicly funded European festivals have played an important role in the past decade. For many of them it is actually guite common to have an art and/or discourse programme, with themes that are mostly related to technological development or the global political situation, in addition to musical performances. Certain theorists claim that festivals such as **Elevate and Donaufestival** in Austria, CTM in Berlin, Unsound in Poland etc. have helped to delve deeper into the issue of contemporary music production and distribution, redirect the discourse on music to societal problems and create an environment that would not only tolerate but also encourage the theoretical and conceptual approach to music. As it turns out, this has

followed many music production trends.

The tendencies of a number of contemporary artists to frame their music with ideas and quotes from social theory and expanding it with accompanying visual, artistic and discourse materials were dubbed "conceptronica" in last year's retrospective piece about the past decade, which was written by the critic Simon Reynolds¹⁰, while at the same time asking the question "why so much electronic music this decade felt like it belonged in a museum instead of a club". The almost scornful ring to that appellation was not accepted well within the broader critical discourse, but at least important discussion about the perception of contemporary electronic and experimental music and the language with which we can interpret it snowballed from there.

If we look at the historically close connection of music with the art world and public institutions, the negative connotations might seem strange. **However, a certain contempt for the intellectual and conceptual in music is actually one of the most resilient elements of the "old"**

discourse in music criticism and one that new trends are

still tackling. This was clear even in the early 2010s, when significant media attention was given to "women who make music with synthesisers." One of the ways for critics to alleviate their own unease about the newly created situation, which dictates that an array of young female musicians should be seen as equal to their male counterparts, was to highlight the academic background of the selected highlighted songwriters - with a university education seeming a justification and an excuse for their excellence. It was nigh impossible to read an article on notable young musicians at the time, such as Holly Herndon, Laurel Halo or Julia Holter, that did not mention their academic title.

⁹ The female:pressure Trouble Makers "FACTS 2020". *Female:pressure*, online edition, 8 March 2020, accessed on 17 August 2020. https://femalepressure.files.wordpress.com/2020/03/facts2020survey-by_femalepressure.pdf

¹⁰ Reynolds, Simon. "The Rise of Coceptronica". *Pitchfork*, online edition, 10 October 2019, accessed on 17 August 2020. https://pitchfork.com/features/article/2010s-rise-of-conceptronica-electronic-music/



This exposed some of the main challenges that the dominant discourse of music criticism was faced with back then: a threat to its amateur charm and the masculine homosocial environment from which it originates, as well as a threat to the deep-rooted nonchalance

threat to the deep-rooted nonchalance with which women were consistently left out of the canonical "best and most important" music in certain genres and periods and the dramatic lack of historical references when it comes to comparisons between female musicians and their musical predecessors, which is something that had been established a long time ago. Instead of helping dispel the myth of inherent individual musical genius, achieving qualification through education was simply used as proof that those women are simply not as brilliant as their male counterparts. Hints of the academic and artistic discourse that accompanied releases by ambitious musicians were rather interpreted as evidence of a lack of authenticity than a case for utilising this somewhat obsolete concept.

The pitfalls of public funding

This is similar to the critical approach directed at the aforementioned festivals and publicly aided music production (which is especially common in northern European countries), whereas the accessibility of public resources is seen by one side as foul play in market competition, and as an element that automatically deprives the work of its authenticity by the other. Of course, this is assuming that "true" artistic expression should come from "within", from authentic personal experience that is inevitably deterred by open conceptualisation and subsequent financial aid. Although it may sound funny, such trains of thought actually reveal an increasingly noticeable derision of music for "rich kids", which many protagonists of the indie music scene have been expressing, including leading contemporary trans icons

Sophie and Arca, as opposed to the actual demand to make artists suffer. (The fact that some protagonists of the contemporary "intelligent" electronic music scene really do rely on eloquently framed statements of intent, even when the content itself does not provide the announced results, is nowhere near reason enough to react hysterically to the supposedly prevalent snobbism of acclaimed performers.)

The critics that do not belong in the Anglo-centric Western circle should also be reminded once in a while that higher education, or at least the vernacular behind it, also grants access to a higher class in areas where education is neither free nor widely available.

Paradoxically, one proven and efficient way to reduce the class gap when it comes to practising art and music is none other than – public funding models. Yet these models are never flawless. One of the

obvious pitfalls is dependence on the politicians responsible for distributing funds, since political conditions and the accompanying ideological positions may change as quickly as the share value of a major sponsor of a commercial event. If this sounds familiar, it is only because it is true.

The other problem is that social models are somewhat susceptible to the law of "market competition". In the aforementioned article "The Rise of Conceptronica", Reynolds astutely identifies a competitive streak that eventually emerged among publicly funded events: "Musicians competing with each other not just to wow audiences but for places on the line-ups. Festivals increasingly look not just for someone who can deliver a slamming DJ set or sonically stunning performance, but for the world-exclusive premieres of a new show that impacts with the avantgarde equivalent of razzle-dazzle."

F

U

R

L

0

Ζ

Α

23

С

Υ

С

L

Ε

Ordinary old-fashioned concerts can no longer be found at progressive electronic music festivals (which is not necessarily a bad thing). The important thing is that the audio-visual or choreographed performance is preferably an exclusive premiere, of course, under the condition that the said festival can afford a premiere - repeat shows are relegated to marginal and less local promoters. The latter are the greatest losers in a situation that was looming well before the current global crisis. Their options seem more like limitations, especially within the context of the general "festivalisation" of electronic and experimental music, which places them in an unenviable position because even when they have public support, they can hardly compete with larger and more extensive events, which have the potential to attract more than just a local audience. However, in the world of the "new normal", in which organising a largescale international event will not be possible for a while, the need for stable, low-key local protagonists may increase.

Is there room for optimism when it comes to the future? On last year's album "Proto", as well as at some impressive backing live shows, Holly Herndon tried to send out a message of unity and solidarity in order to provide hope for a better tomorrow. Appearing as a guest on the recently launched podcast "Interdependence", which is moderated by herself and Dryhurst, was the Belarusian researcher and writer Evgeny Morozov, who pessimistically concluded that we should not necessarily expect the current crisis to instigate radical change and the breakdown of capitalism, which has proved time and time again to be more resilient than we thought. Be that as it may, it is reassuring to see that the state and future of music scenes and the music industry is being discussed more seriously and extensively, at least within the context of the, until recently, relatively inert discourse on music. "It is impossible for music to remain outside the political sphere, particularly when so many bodies are surrounded by precarity, violence and uncertain times", Jon Davies wrote almost prophetically in an article¹¹ for FACT

Magazine that was published on December 2019. The important thing is that these precarious and marginalised bodies finally occupy a performative, as well as a media space, thus at least ensuring the representation of neglected perspectives, which open up new possibilities for seeing the big picture. We may have started the last decade with strong insistence on feminist issues, such as representation and the ways of representing women and other marginalised groups within the discourse of music and the music industry in general, but by its end, we slowly but safely arrived at a far more intensive further deconstruction of a discourse that ultimately leads to classrelated issues, as well as to far-reaching contemplations on the possibility of creating a more fair and solidary industry and global scene.



¹¹ Davies, Jon. "Interdependence, or how I learned to love again on the dancefloor". FACT, online edition, 20 December 2019, accessed on 17 August 2020. https://www.factmag.com/2019/12/20/interdependence-or-how-i-learned-to-love-again-on-the-dancefloor/



How art : TAMARA PUHOVSKI saves the Roma and how they in turn save art

Discarded items transformed through art build a route from the ghetto to the centre of society

The name sprang up from combining the first two letters of the Croatian words for the Roma (Romi) and artists (umjetnici), and it primarily denotes the community. It also denotes the social enterprise based on the community and centred around the Roma community, which deals with the upcycling of waste into artwork or furnishings. As part of its mission to rescue what's been discarded or forgotten, RoUm brings together the people, knowledge, skills and enthusiasm necessary for the conversion of waste, but also for the development of the Romani communities, equality, sustainability, applied arts and inclusive design. It leans on the tradition of reusing, recycling and the sale of discarded items, as well as Roma crafts and trades, while at the same time it

strives to affirm new entrepreneurial practices and explore the transformative social and ecological power of art. It connects culture and the trends of the elite, such as upcycling, exhibitions, and unique items, with communities and items that form part of the marginalised **sphere**, thus building two-way

communicational, infrastructural and organisational routes from the ghettos to the centre of society, which are now, thanks to the transformative power of the artistic process, being trodden by neglected people and forgotten items, along with their knowledge, skills and stories.

One of the reasons why we launched this project was the fact that today, many people dabble with environmentalism. which has transformed the conversion of used items into a fad, while the Roma, who have been relegated to the position of waste handlers due to discrimination, are nowhere to be found. They are not present in online sales or social entrepreneurship, they are not working in start-ups or developing innovations. Saying that all you need is a good idea, and a bit of perseverance in order to succeed simply doesn't hold water if you happen to find yourself at the margins of society or if living in a ghetto, which makes the saying a mere mantra of the privileged. RoUm, on the other hand, is an example of how, through innovation, true and reliable partnership and support, along with the transformative power of art and a pinch of capital, things can change. The basic idea was to make use of the prejudice that the "Roma handle waste" and subversively convert it into capital that would jumpstart the creative industry.

Conceptions that created the community

Upcycling.

This is a process of turning useless or unwanted items into new materials or products of higher quality and added value. It is different from recycling in that the items and materials do not become new raw materials, but entirely new and improved items with a new value.

28

R

Upcycling at RoUm includes working with wood, metal and electronic and textile waste. Even though many of the Roma who take part in the community have never completed any form of art education, and perhaps they don't even possess the same kinds of knowledge as their fellow artists who are not Roma, they still often prove to be masters of upcycling. Over 95% of each RoUm item comes from waste, while the rest of it is made up of, e.g., screws, new light bulbs or some other product that people necessarily buy.

Once the conversion of secondary raw

Innovation.

o U m

R

30

materials and waste management had become hot topics, the Roma were pushed out of the sector, but the idea of the project was to turn this negative aspect into a competitive advantage. This project created a space where people could learn from the Roma, while their own advancement to the role of an expert or role model has proven to be significant support in the fight against prejudice. This idea, which forms the basis of the community, and that received the award for social innovation from the Baden-Württemberg Foundation in 2017, in this way seeks to redefine the attitudes towards the Roma and raise the people's awareness of the injustices done to them in times past, but also to consider new products and services based on the process of upcycling. One of the innovative possibilities is, for example, art leasing, where those who cannot afford to buy pieces could lease and enjoy the items. This option is mostly offered to

coffee shops and commercial premises. Apart from making art widely available, such practice also supports the selfsustainability of a community lacking the financial means to secure an exhibition area, as well as the establishment of new forms of collaboration that are conducive to a stronger fight against prejudice, because in such a way, the messages of RoUm itself are made even more available to wider audiences. Further development of the business resulted in the emergence of innovative products made from waste textiles, such as modular suitcase pockets, while the coronavirus crisis gave rise to yet another service called Pimp My Bike, which strives to repair people's bikes and make them more visually attractive, thus encouraging the more frequent use of people's two-wheelers. One of the basic ideas of RoUm. the effort to reduce the amount of waste, served as a catalyst for the creation of an online platform available to a wider community of artists in the field of upcycling where people could post the discarded items that they found and offer them for sale as new products made in co-creation with their prospective customers. A digital storytelling solution is also under development, using blockchain technology, to tell the stories of these items, create archives to contain stories of their origin, as well as virtual exhibitions. This learning process is being shared with Roma children so that everyone involved can benefit from the knowledge and skills acquired in the fields of storytelling and technology, and the ultimate goal of this process is to create a stronger bond between the items and those who buy them.

A change for the better.

RoUm wants to positively impact the environment by promoting item conversion instead of the devastating cycle of buying and discarding items, which keeps growing and becoming increasingly widespread, thus posing a significant threat to our survival, while additional goals of the project are the employment of Roma and changing the attitudes to the members of the community. Negotiations are also underway regarding our cooperation with the Academy of Fine Arts in Zagreb, which would make it possible for Roma to hold lectures and workshops on upcycling, thus paving another way of leaving the margins, joining the centre of society and winning another battle in the war against prejudice. All the changes achieved with the help of art, i.e. the transformations of the Roma community and society at large are also being monitored and measured, so, for example, we are now familiar with the social return on investment and the figures show that every Euro invested into RoUm generates 2.06 Euros of social gains.

Inclusive design.

During the inception and development of the RoUm project, members of the community who are not in the fields of culture and art were taught by expert partners, such as Rijeka 2020, about the various conceptions that can be applied in their activities. They also acquired new theoretical knowledge and practical skills, which then helped them significantly improve their work performance and quality. One of these

conceptions is inclusive design, which, even during the creative process or within its goal and subject matter, puts the emphasis on those who are excluded, forgotten and neglected. And this is exactly how we designed the work processes here at RoUm. The artists, master craftsmen and apprentices get paid in advance for their work, and due to the economic exclusion of these workers, the expenses are covered through sales and donations. Artists and designers from Croatia and abroad were involved in the project, and the question of (self)identification of the participants arose as one of the topics. None of the Roma men and women who took part in the workshop viewed themselves as artists and they didn't want to identify as such. As a future career, art is often not considered a desirable choice even among members of mainstream society, so it goes without saying that it is almost inconceivable as a professional path among members of the Roma communities, especially if it doesn't involve music. After almost three years of having worked with us, our best-selling artist, who also happens to be a Roma, has finally decided to sign his works as an artist and not a master, welder or something else. After a great deal of thought on the difference between functional welding and welding as a technique used in the creative process, the inclusive process of design using waste has had a pronounced effect on the perception of art and artists within the Roma community. Moreover, the Roma youth do take part in production workshops, and the Roma

leaders do work on the educational

dimension and the acknowledgement

31

J I had worked on **Roma integration** for 15 years at the time, but my cooperation with their Slavonski Brod community was truly excellent. We went there to help bring together two artists and a few Roma who can do things, play an instrument or who are artistically talented. We began in an unfinished part of a house and, with encouragement from the entire neighbourhood, we prepared some items that had already been discarded in the

junkyard... **>**

Jagoda Novak, expert for Roma integration of their artistic or administrative talents so that these young people can be further supported in their development in a certain area. All this is done, among other reasons, in an effort to provide them with better access to the labour market. Both of these significant outcomes of the inclusive design of RoUm items are achieved very guickly and effectively through the process of artistic expression. Besides, it's been known to happen for non-Romani artists to take note of the above-average creativity of Roma youth, but also of how good they are with their hands, and this kind of talent also arises as a by-product of living in a deprived community where the children have copious amounts of leisure time wherein they can develop their skills at fixing things rather than hiring a repairman fix things for them. This is how the inclusive RoUm process had a profound impact on children and young people who found themselves in an educational setting where Roma children could learn from them, and where they are far more advanced than their peers.

From an idea to an established social enterprise – or a brief history

The zero year / Frustration as a catalyst

The project was conceived by Tamara Puhovski and frustration at the fact that she lives in a country where ghettos exist – and not only that, but also a country where the only existing ghettos are those of the

Roma, and they are not spoken of as areas defined by injustice that makes it virtually impossible to leave them. The chances of obtaining an education, a job or access to culture and new interesting content often get compromised by the very nature of the projects that "deal" with the Roma, as they are geared towards satisfying their basic needs, such as food, infrastructure and elementary education. Interaction with the Roma community almost always implies that its members are the ones that need to be taught, improved and integrated, while hardly anyone gives a second thought to what we could learn from the Romani, in terms of e.g. creativity, handicrafts and upcycling.

2017 / The first workshop passes the test

RoUm started with a workshop in Slavonski Brod we used it to test the waters regarding our idea and, considering that it came from the outside, from people who are not part of the Roma community, it received a great deal of attention. This is why Jagoda Novak was the very first person to join our team, where she used all of her knowledge and experience gained through working with Roma communities to set up an experimental workshop. The response from the community was outstanding, and conducive to an immediate agreement between the Roma and two artists, Morana Stinčić and Igor Lenard, to set up another such workshop in Zagreb. Soon after, the workshop took place, which meant that the *proof of concept* phase had come to an end and a decision was reached on further investments into the values the project strived to promote.

2018 / Growth and development backed by our partners

The community continued to grow in terms of intensity and activities, and



R

0

U

by organically attracting new artists, partners and, of course, new members of the Roma community who came not only from Slavonski Brod but also from Zagreb and Rijeka. RoUm originated as a project of a company formerly named ProPuh, now also known as Impact House, while its baby steps were secured by the company owner as an experienced activist and project manager. The decision that the project's finances would be handled through the company's assets was especially important, as it saved us the time that would have been spent on fundraising activities and administrative requirements. This time was then channelled into the planning and implementation of activities and it also opened a space for innovations and a search for an optimal business model, and a model of social transformation. This enabled us to form partnerships

that are more focused on expertise and securing the kind of support that the community needs, rather than only focusing on its financial aspect. However, the further development of RoUm was marked by some very tough decisions and going back to the basic values of the project. During the business plan development phase, it became clear that focusing exclusively on upcycling and quantity, i.e. the number of artists and items involved, would both bolster the financial stability of the project and secure profits, but such a course of action was turned down, as social transformation was our top priority. With significant help from the ACT group as experts in the field of social entrepreneurship, we ultimately managed to strike a balance between

social transformation as the end and profits as a means, which at a core level, is actually the very definition of a social enterprise. The other aspect of development was in the field of culture, i.e. art, but the members of our project team lacked the necessary expertise and experience in the field, and there's a very strong likelihood that finding partners whose teams include experimentally oriented, socially responsible top-level experts would not have been possible at the time, had it not been for the Rijeka 2020 project and its *Kitchen of Diversity* flagship. From its inception, the threeyear collaboration with the Kitchen flagship has been done in exactly the way collaborations are supposed to be done; not in such a way that the partner forces their own programme and the items necessary for the implementation of the budget on others, which then results in the modification of the project proposal and activities so that they meet not the needs of the community that they strive to transform, but the needs of the project funders instead. Genuine collaboration should be based on mentorship, the sharing of resources, ranging from knowledge to social capital, which RoUm did not have, so as to jointly secure its success. Such a collaboration resulted in capacity building, learning the necessary knowledge, from professional jargon and conceptions all the way to the processes, which in turn made it possible for RoUm to establish other partnerships such as the ones with Kultura Nova and Reach for Change.



Siniša Senad Musić, the director of RoUm, tells us that there has always been spite (within the Roma community) as it hasn't always been very clear who was supposed to do what and how much money was at stake in the various projects dealing with the Roma community, as he continues:

RoUm hasn't been affected by this problem because we are a social enterprise and we only hire Roma, which in turn also changes the attitudes towards the projects within the community itself. Thus far, we have never competed against any other Roma associations, and the current Roma social enterprises do not exist as such. The Roma community isn't displaying any signs of resistance towards **RoUm**, perhaps because it is, after all, predominantly Roma.

R

ο

U

m

2019 / **Independence** and

coming back "home" From the very beginning, ProPuh put forth its own definition of success: to render itself obsolete. And so during

2019, four months ahead of the plan, the company donated the brand name, the social enterprise, and all the inventory items to the Croatian Roma Youth Organization of Croatia, who became the new owner and manager of RoUm, headed by the new director, Siniša Senad Musić. The results of the project were measured in many ways, but perhaps the best evidence for success can be found in the data showing that everyone who attended the opening workshop in 2017 is a part of RoUm to this day, and that the core team hasn't changed in any way, it only grew bigger. Especially the fact that RoUm has come back to the community that launched it, but this time with the community at its helm.

2020 / **Empowerment through** working closely together with children and young people

In 2020, RoUm continues to grow and develop new ideas, and to work even more closely with children and young people, but also by finding employment for Roma, as well as finding ways to increase and strengthen its own positive social impact. The Roma who took part in the workshops will become mentors at the Academy of Fine Arts in Zagreb, and RoUm will showcase its programme entitled the "Days of the Discarded" at a large exhibition in Rijeka.

How we have erred and what we have learned from each other

Many of the mistakes we have made arose from the demanding complexity of working with a deprived community, and due to inexperience and lack of knowledge. From the fact that we eventually came to the realisation that, if the workshops take place in coffee shops, the personnel working there need to be told in advance that our lecturers are Roma, to prevent them refusing them entry because they are "panhandling", to learning that in public transit, we must package and secure our items, because they are no longer merely an old shovel or a door handle, but works of art. Apart from that, we also had to open a dedicated craft business and find a way of financing the work or transportation of people who at times, administratively speaking, do not even exist, they do not have bank accounts or are in foreclosure.



As is the case with every start-up, we've invested a lot of our time into the development and testing of new products or services, not all of which got to see the light of day – not to mention that we couldn't have done it without 2.06 the help of experienced and dedicated partners such as the ACT group or Rijeka 2020, who knew how to shorten these processes or make it easier for us to handle them, though by no means to eliminate them, as they are a necessary part of development.

Even though the initial idea was to make use of the transformational power of art to foster change within the community, we really could not have imagined the true extent of this power. Together with one single family made up of people of various backgrounds and experiences, it created a new business venture, thus providing employment for the Roma people, but it also has unveiled the potential of above-average creativity and handicraft hidden within the Roma community.

SUCCESS **NUMBERS**

products vears in existence Roma artists, master craftsmen, apprentices involved in the production process full-time employees 3 28 new bulbs 5 cities children in storytelling workshops euros of social gains for every Euro invested into the project

UR ECIPE R

64

A car trailer full of metal and wood waste, two tablespoons of inclusive design, with constant stirring until it boils. Add three teaspoons of Roma tradition and a pinch of capital, a generous sprinkling of enthusiasm and cook until ruddy.

R

ο

U

m

REVIEW OF SMALL LITERATURES

THE FESTIVAL OF THE EUROPEAN SHORT STORY

8

When you have a revolution on one side

and the preservation of heritage on the other,

best thing to do is "mix the ingredients"

40

In the 1975 monograph "Kafka: Toward a Minor Literature"¹², the French philosophers Gilles Deleuze and Felix Guattari put forth one of the first definitions of minority literature by

- Е analysing the specifics of Franz Kafka's
- S

F

opus and placing an emphasis on his identity as a German Jew in Prague. They S do not define it as literature written in a minority language, but as literature written by minorities in the majority language. As such, it is not produced somewhere far away, outside and separate from the "major", but instead functions within by utilising the same elements and the dominant language in a somewhat different manner. It disrupts the language and causes it to stutter, transform, change meaning and open up new avenues of interpretation, which

2 DVNJA MATIĆ BENČIĆ

become areas of experimentation when deprived of the security of dominant social codes. It should also be noted that this term differs in many ways from the everyday use of the notion "minor", but since this is one of the first attempts at defining it, and one that is still significant, we should pay some attention to it.

Among other things, Deleuze and Guattari mention three basic tenets of minority literature. The first one is characterised by the aforementioned ability to "deterritorialise" the majority language or, in other words, to disrupt its usual meanings and codes through defamiliarisation. The other characteristic of minority literature concerns its political aspects. Each de-

12 Deleuze, Gilles; Guattari, Felix. Kafka: Toward a Minor Literature. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1986.

signification of language and usurpation of established societal codes also disrupts the entrenched power relations, which renders experimentation with meaning a potentially political act. Literature that is rooted within the territory of its language, at the same time uses social context as a backdrop against which to ask and play out individual questions, while minority literature does exactly the opposite. Even when centring on the individual, it always reflects the collective. There is no single subject with a voice; quite the contrary, as each individual statement echoes collective speech. Which brings us to the third tenet, the collective character of minority literature. It is literature that encourages active solidarity, while the author that addresses us from a marginal position paves the way for other consciousnesses, sensibilities and interpretations that never hold still and always take us to other places and beyond.

The author looks to the future and invokes from the margin a potential new community, which is actually the utopian role of minority literature, one that lays down condition for a revolution. In that sense.

Deleuze and Guattari pose the question of how to become a minority and a stranger in one's own language, a nomad and a wanderer charting a new world, how to surrender to this eternal becoming that never stops and stands still in this new system of meaning and within new dominant societal codes. Being a minority and writing in a minority

language becomes a privilege, a creative honour and an opportunity to seize what is yet to come. Only the minority possesses the ability of permanent transformation, it is the only thing that can perennially elude the conditioning of dominant societal codes.

It is evident from this short introduction to a very complex theoretical system that it undoubtedly idealises and romanticises the concept of the minority. The analysis also has its fair share of generalisation, which should not involve a single example, no matter how representative it may be. To claim that something is, in and of itself, political and connected with the collective, to assume the production of active solidarity and revolution, to be certain of one's "liberation from the Master", authority or codes, to herald the freedom to multiply the possibilities of reading, open experimentation, as well as the arrival of the future and a new community, suggests a romantic generalisation that relies on a single representative sample. For that matter, can we and may we claim that these wanderers and revolutionaries, who proffer yet untested future possibilities, are truly representative? While Kafka's work may be illustrative, it is insufficient for the onerous task of defining the minority. After all, Kafka has become canonical, a literary great of irrefutable stature. And we should consider ourselves lucky that he is accessible, omnipresent and immediate. Many will never reach such heights and will always remain within the realm of the minorities and the minor, with elusiveness as the only connection to the definition offered by Deleuze and Guattari.

Philosophical concept or "concrete" creation

Numerous interpretations of the minority, in literature as well as in art, still rely on that theoretical framework. Let us take Simon O'Sullivan's essay "Notes toward a minor art practice" as an example.¹³ In it, he offers five examples of minority art practices as criticism of the dominant and major ones. Firstly, he covers feminist and post-colonial art practices, which are aimed at criticisms of modernism. In that regard, the second example stems from art practices that were also a part of modernism, but

R

S

L

42

that have turned against it. These are "modernism's other voice", the Dadaists, Futurists and Situationists, who made the language stammer and stutter. O'Sullivan poses the question of how and why a minority art ultimately becomes major one, but does not provide an answer in this essay. Instead, we move onto the third minority art practice: performance and other art forms, which are positioned outside the gallery and typical and traditional definitions of art. The fourth example pertains to practices centring on the local. It is also important to recognise that contemporary art increasingly takes on a form derived from the international art market, while minority practices focus on the local or on the use of specifically non-artistic materials. Minority art practices ultimately encompass all the activities and expressions involved in the "neutralization of sense", de-signifying those that rely on the importance of an open process and as such are always

becoming. Leading on from that, it is clear that O'Sullivan does not stray away from the definitions set forth by Deleuze and Guattari. This is why it is useful to consult with the critics.

One such example is Jadranka Cergol's recent study entitled "A case study in the literary production of the Italian minority in Slovenia and Croatia and of the Slovenian minority in Italy"¹⁴. In it, Cergol identifies several characteristics of minority literature, the first being writing about the connection with the native country. **In this regard,**

another frequent motif is the conservation of the roots, existence and development of the spiritual and cultural heritage that future generations inherit from their ancestors and thus

emphasise the strong connections to the past.

Also analysed are relationships with other close, vet different neighbours. In addition to this, the importance of language is often stressed in minority literature. As opposed to O'Sullivan's analysis, which considers Dadaism and Futurism a minority literature, Cergol infers that the authors of regional literature "continuously struggle to avoid extreme hermeticism and postmodernism, as well as language experimentation especially in poetry form". This is because they view "language as a value they both need to safeguard", and are as such, less prone to experimentation and more to classical expression. She also mentions that such literature is not immune to the "bacteria of nationalism", although criticism of nationalism is also present, especially among younger male and female authors. str. 48

43





¹³ O'Sullivan, Simon. "Notes towards a minor art practice". Drain: Journal of Contemporary Art and Culture, 2005. https://www.simonosullivan.net/articles/minor-literature.pdf



¹⁴ Cergol, Jadranka. "An attempt at defining 'minority' literature: A case study in the literary production of the Italian minority in Slovenia and Croatia and of the Slovenian minority in Italy". *International Journal of Language, Translation and Intercultural Communication*, 2, 2015, pp. 61-68. https//doi.org/10.12681/ijtlic.23

Promoting creativity in languages that are always "other"

1

Review of Small Literatures organised by the Zagreb-based Association for promotion of cultures, Kulturtreger, presents awardwinning writers whose works have not been translated and published in Croatia, but who are very well-known and respected in their home countries. These are authors and literatures from areas that may have a large population, but whose languages, due to the hegemony of the West, are always "other", while the voices of their speakers are necessarily minority voices. In 2017, the festival visited Rijeka with their programme The United States of Levant, which, for the first time, showcased the works of the banned Syrian novelist and screenwriter Khaled Khalifa, who refuses to leave his country, along with the young Jordanian author Maanu Abu Taleba, with the participation of Asmaa Azaizeh (Palestine), Golan Haji (Syria/Kurdistan), Sahar Mandour (Lebanon/Egypt), Adania Shibli (Palestine) and Fawwaz Traboulsi (Lebanon). One year later, at a review called *Rebellious Desire*, male and female authors from the Maghreb countries shared their works of poetry and fiction, featuring Mohammed Berrada (Morocco), Lamis Saidi (Algeria), Habib Selmi (Tunisia) and Laïla Marrakchi (Libya). The theme of the 2019 festival was *Egypt* and the programme was centred around the works of journalist and writer Mansoura Ez-Eldin.

иоли и рысо Ртедаратујел пеорібал клјіжеми ргојекt павt Віјеўкі takat babanica ili ispovjedaonica ili psihijatrijski kauč

28-

ADINOA tivala Totival toti

Four years of cooperation culminate in a grand finale at the Port of Diversity

The Festival of the European Short Story, colloquially known as the FEKP, visited Rijeka in 2017 with the theme Port of Europe, then as part of the Kitchen of Diversity in 2018 with Heritage and again in 2019 with the theme Homo narrans. The Palach cultural centre was chosen as its permanent residence and the audience was regularly drawn to it not only by the quality of the works of European and international short story writers, but also by the laid back atmosphere and interesting accompanying programmes. During the three years FEKP has welcomed authors from twenty countries.

featuring for example Rosa Montero (Spain), Ondjaki (Angola), DBC Pierre (Australia), Igiaba Scego (Italy/ Somalia), Hassan Blasim (Irag/ Finland), Chika Unigwe (Nigeria/ Netherlands), Ignacio Martínez de Pisón (Spain), Ben Okri (UK/Nigeria), Carlos Fonseca (Costa Rica) and Antonio Ortuño (Mexico), while at the same time promoting many Croatian writers. Other than that, two new programmes were also launched in cooperation with the Kitchen of Diversity, a short story contest for authors under the age of 19 called FEKP19 and a cycle called "I'll drive you a story". This was a project where Rijeka's authors and artists took their stories "for a drive" in "cooperation" with the city's taxi drivers, ambulance drivers and other emergency care providers, Autotrolej buses, HŽ

(Croatian Railways) Passenger Transport, Jadrolinija Ferries and the Čistoća utility company trucks.

RIJEKA » Prepuni Palach i nabrijana atmosfera kao da smo na nekom rock koncertu-The Finale of the multi-year cooperation



will take place at the 19th edition of the festival taking place from 4th to 9th October 2020, with the theme of the Port of Diversity. The port as a place of encounters, exchange, getting to know each other and dialogue, and diversity as wealth, possibility and freedom form the backbone of the gathering of writers from around the globe. Among other things, it will feature: Yann Martel (Canada), Irvine Welsh (UK), Elif Shafak (France), Claudia Durastanti (Italy), Aleksandar Hemon (BiH/USA). Semezdin Mehmedinović (BiH) and Mazen Maarouf (Palestine/Iceland). The event will also welcome the world-renowned Hay Festival from Wales, which, since its establishment in 1987, has taken place in more than 30 countries on five continents, and Rijeka will see its anthology "Hay Festival Europe28: Visions of the Future" published by Fraktura. The project brings together 28 female authors, writers, artists and scientists, one from each EU member state, who will use reading sessions, workshops, performances and debates as platforms for sharing their visions of the future with attending audiences.

Be that as it may, memory plays an important role in minority literature in which dealing with historical traumas is a frequent theme. The characteristics identified by Cergol can be described as attempts to conserve identity, the connection to the past and the importance of heritage. All this is at odds with the characteristics mentioned by Deleuze and Guattari, as continuous existence, revolutionary potentials and the nomadic journey toward the future are scarcely addressed in her analysis.

There is no need to enter into a debate on which of the aforementioned definitions is closer to the truth. Instead of eliminating one of them, we can accept both as mirror images of minority literature. One definition pertains to, let us say, *high-concept art*, a philosophical concept of the minority as a unique means of creation and the other to, so to speak, "concrete" literary creation

- F
- Ε

R

S

L

48

encompasses the ideas of playing and

within a specific cultural, ethnic or

national minority. The first definition

S S

exploring, as well as the presence of strong and often hermetic social criticism, and within this context, we can discuss change, openness and the inclination to create new and different consciousnesses. Conversely, the themes of the conversion of heritage and history are connected to the other definition of the minority, which is characterised by more traditional expressions that do not favour linguistic or other forms of experimentation. In future discussions on minority literature, it should be stated which definition is taken into

consideration.

A place for everyone in the global and local space

Although, both definitions can be included sometimes. The flagships of the Rijeka 2020 – European Capital of Culture project have often made attempts to fuse and link these two camps. The activities of the seven flagships have centred on the collaboration of small communities with European and global artists on connecting local stories with new, other and different influences, playing with heritage, as well as bringing together various art and cultural traditions. Kitchen of Diversity, as the name suggests, is a flagship that mixes these ingredients. It is a flagship that is described as focusing on "migration, minorities and unusual combinations of music, cuisine, art and activism" and that "comprises inclusive programmes".¹⁵ Or in other words, "everyone is invited to the Kitchen of Diversity. It creates a space for everyone." And that moment of "creating a space for everyone" is particularly related to Deleuze and Guattari's concept of the minority, the one that acknowledges space for producing "new" expressions and interpretations, as well as new prospective communities.

The first look at this content-rich literary programme clearly confirms thematic consistency with the aforementioned

goal. Firstly, the Review of Small Literatures, a festival initiated by the Booksa/Kulturtreger organisation from Zagreb, introduced the audience to authors "from the part of the world that is labelled unstable and problematic, as well as from language areas that may have a large population, but whose languages, due to the hegemony of the West, are always 'Other', while the voices of their speakers are necessarily minority."¹⁶ In addition to thematically delving into the political aspects of minority creation, as well as addressing the issue of marginalisation, the Festival of the European Short Story, whose motto is "Homo Narrans", raised another important question: "Do we all have equal rights and opportunities to tell our story? Are we, as individuals and as a society, ready to hear the stories of others?" They go on to say: "Humans have always navigated the sea of stories, and understanding this skill and deeply human need, as well as pushing the boundaries of what we are prepared to hear and understand, is a yardstick against which our understanding of the new Europe and the world we live in is measured."¹⁷

Inclusion is imperative for the new world, which must have a place for the other and other voices, as well as for hitherto untold stories and life destinies. That is how literature ended up in a place where we would not usually

look for it. As part of the festival subprogramme "I'll drive you a story",

male and female authors from Rijeka rode in taxis, talking with the male and female drivers, taking in their professional and private experiences, asking questions and transforming them into stories. In 2020, five artists from Rijeka embarked on a similar journey, but this time they used "road, rail and maritime transportation, trailing the panorama of the city and its surroundings, conversing with Čistoća, Jadrolinija, Croatian Railways, Autotrolej and private ambulance drivers."¹⁸ We should also mention the short story competition, which in the last two years has also included the youngest writing enthusiasts, as well as primary and secondary school pupils. It is a charming coincidence that the theme of this year's competition is Visions for the Future. Deleuze and Guattari's interpretation of the minority may have offered us a mere romantic generalisation, but it is one that is apparently essential to us at the moment.

49

And in the end, perhaps we should all ask ourselves, as Simon O'Sullivan did in passing in his essay, can artistic activity under the auspices of large organisations really be considered minority? It can. Moreover, when large organisations support this dance of tradition and modernity, inherited and newly created, when they encourage encounters between the global and the local and connect artists with other workers, both male and female, then we will have plenty to write about. Because is only then that we will have finally entered the uncharted space of the future.

¹⁵ Rijeka 2020 website,

https://rijeka2020.eu/program/kuhinja-razlicitosti/

Rijeka 2020, website, https://rijeka2020.eu/najavljujemo-reviju-malih-knjizevnosti-sjedinjene-drzave-levanta/
Rijeka 2020, website, https://rijeka2020.eu/dogadjanja/18-festival-europske-kratke-price/
Rijeka 2020, website, 6 June 2020, accessed on 25 August 2020. https://rijeka2020.eu/vozim-ti-pricu-2020/



The body we need to save as well as the theatre

our right to decent work,

NATAXA ANTULOV

The body had to die so that labor power could live."¹⁹ Beginning a text on the Fifth Ensemble with this sentence may seem somewhat grim at first glance, but I am certain that quoting this thought of Silvia Federici is the best way to describe the problematic relationships between the body, work and the issue of inclusion. In the book "Caliban and the Witch", Federici analyses how in a capitalist society, the body has been to women what the factory has been for male waged workers, the primary ground of their exploitation and resistance, as the female body has been appropriated by the state and men and forced to function as a means for the reproduction and accumulation of labour. Thus, the importance that the body in all its aspects, from sexuality to maternity, acquired in feminist theory in the 1970s has not been misplaced. Until then, the female body had been identified with the sphere of the private, which truly was the sphere of women's activities in the form of unpaid housework. For women, the body was at the same time a source of identity and a prison.

As with any other body subjected to violence, covering up and obscuration, exploitative practices are imprinted in the female body and will not dissipate until we are prepared to take care of each body and, of course, by transcending the anthropocentric position, of each being, thing and phenomenon. Therefore, it is no coincidence that the Fifth Ensemble project is primarily envisioned as a platform for taking care of each other, which is the very essence

of theatre. We have been asked numerous times about how we would make our work presentable and what shape it would take in order to turn what is being watched into something legitimately worth watching, as well as how what is being watched would show that disabled people are capable of working in theatre. In an interview that took place during her visit to Rijeka, the American director Anne Bogart offered a potential definition of theatre: "Theatre is about how we get along." In that sense, theatre functions as a shadow of sorts that is cast against other social organisations because it has the ability, with each new process, to repeatedly question how we can co-exist as a group and what we can do for each other in the process of bringing things to life. The task of achieving co-existence requires us to pinpoint the interest in the world and the presentation of things therein that are taking shape.

We should also ask ourselves whether we need (artistic) work that is not driven by the logic of mutual care and in which human bodies are replaced by machines and a bureaucratic apparatus? Do we need work in which there is no room for any other experiences of the body beyond that of oppression? Moreover, it is not until we are able to fathom the meaning behind Silvia Federici's sentence that we can begin discussing inclusive practice. With that being said, I am establishing a discourse that is not part of so-called inspirational pornography; this is not a text that will make anyone feel better or worse, it neither provides motivation for one's own life nor does it instrumentalise the experiences of colleagues and fellow citizens who are being publicly discriminated.

The differently abled in a pioneering project

The Fifth Ensemble started as an initiative borne out of the "Theatre to the People" programme by the Croatian National Theatre Ivan pl. Zajc, which attempted to deconstruct the notion of "national" within a meaning that conveys the stabilisation of a certain national or local mythology. In his study "Introduction to Applied Theatre: Who Owns the Theatre?", Darko Lukić poses the same question as the Croatian National Theatre Ivan pl. Zajc did at the time: "To whom theatre belongs? To its owners and founders? To its performers? To the society in which it exists? To all of them? To what extent and degree?"20

F

н

53

Е

Ν

S

Е

Μ

В

L

Ε

¹⁹ Federici, Silvia. Caliban and the Witch. Belgrade: Burevesnik, 2013.

²⁰ Lukić, Darko. Introduction to Applied Theatre: Who Owns the Theatre? Zagreb: Leykam International, 2016.

"Descendants, Giants, Gods"

"The Fifth Ensemble is place for friendship, communication and collaboration. It is a place where we learn from each other and where our theatrical future begins. The Fifth Ensemble is a life of equal opportunities. Equal chances. Without privileges. With a right. With contribution."

Mustano

Excerpt from the invitation to the play

The goal of this project is to integrate young people with developmental and other disabilities into the labour market through preparatory cultural and artistic activities, which will provide them with the skills, work habits and new knowledge necessary for working in theatre. The Croatian National Theatre Ivan pl. Zajc, which has four professional art ensembles operating under its roof, should have a fifth ensemble within a few years that would employ people with special needs, similar to other European theatres, such as the Blue Teapot Theatre Company from Galway, Ireland, Glad from Denmark, Per.art from Serbia etc. In other words, the aim of this

F

1

F

т

similar to other European theatres, such as the Blue Teapot Theatre Company from Galway, Ireland, Glad from Denmark, Per.art from Serbia etc. In other words, the aim of this **project was to have institutions cooperate in bringing together young differently abled people,** who would be educated and **prepared for long-term work in an art ensemble, where they would create exciting highquality performance art.** It should also be noted that this is a completely pioneering project, since this would be the first ensemble consisting of differently abled people from Croatia and operating within a national theatre.

In addition to the Centre for Education, which is attended by young people with developmental and other disabilities, collaboration has also been undertaken with the Rijeka 21 association for young people with Down syndrome. Following the completion of the education programme, the play "Descendants, Giants, Gods" was performed on the stage of the Croatian National Theatre

Ivan pl. Zaic in front of 600 people, as part of the Festival of Inclusive Scenes in June 2019. Branko Mijić, the columnist for Novi List, wrote the following: "The Fifth Ensemble is the best thing that could have happened to us at a time and in a society in which the lack of understanding and acceptance of others who are different seems at odds with a civilised society. The play 'Descendants, Giants, Gods', which was performed as part of the Rijeka European Capital of Culture 2020 project, is more important than all the buildings, walls and facilities that will be erected for this purpose." The Fifth Ensemble was soon introduced in the articles of association of the Croatian National Theatre Ivan pl. Zajc, as well as in the theatre's four-year programme (2021 - 2025).

In 2020, the Fifth Ensemble was supposed to stage its first professional production as part of the *Kitchen* of Diversity flagship of the Rijeka -European Capital of Culture project, thus demonstrating that the city should consider implementing cultural policies that include all bodies and experiences of its residents. With the emergence of the coronavirus pandemic, the entire concept of the ECoC had to be restructured and the financial framework was significantly modified, making this already vulnerable project even more vulnerable as it was forced to face the aforementioned dilemmas. Can we, in a moment of vulnerability, show solidarity with those who were considerably less privileged than us before the crisis?

Isn't isolation the perfect moment to better understand the experiences of our fellow citizens who have had to spend their entire lives in isolation and social obscuration? Or, to put it simply, why are we convinced that we deserve better life conditions than others and what have we done to deserve them? By having superior genes? By having a superior financial status? "There are no wrong people. However, caring for the 'wrong' people is more and more socially discouraged, made difficult and criminalized. For many, the crisis of care has been there for a very long time."²¹

The brilliant shadow of collective care

Pirate Care is a project associated with a different flagship, although it goes hand in hand with the content of *Kitchen of Diversity*. It is included in the Dopolavoro flagship, which deals with various aspects of work, particularly those that do not seem like work, do not gualify as work, or are deemed illegal activities. The project initiators, Valeria Graziani, Marcell Mars and Tomislav Medak, want to use it as a theoretical framework for practices that are defined as collectively organised care and mutual assistance and that are a response to the various aspects of the institutional care crisis: privatisation, the dissolution

of the welfare state, austerity policies and the criminalisation of migration and solidarity.²² They provide examples such as female captains being arrested for saving people at sea, a person facing 35 years in prison for downloading scientific papers, people risking charges for providing contraception to those who do not have any access to it.

"Caring for the wrong people" is a phrase that is no less hurtful than the one used by Silvia Federici at the beginning of this text, yet it is equally vital for understanding inclusive policies, as well as the long and winding road taken by individuals in a community to implement inclusive policies in institutions and to have people with disabilities treated equally to other citizens. By insisting on creating circumstances that would allow everyone to realise their potentials, we often find ourselves in situations where it is made clear that our ideas are unprofitable humanitarian luxuries and admirable good intentions that are incongruous with the real world. We had a crisis even when there was **none.** After the pandemic, the crisis had simply become an irrefutable argument.

The WHO estimates that approximately 15% of the global population has some sort of disability, many of whom are

Pirate Care, website, accessed on 25 August 2020. https://syllabus.pirate.care/#care-a-political-notion
Perić, Ivana; Medak, Tomislav. "Neoliberal mantras remain an unfunny joke". *H-alter.org*, website, 26 March 2020, accessed on 23 August 2020. http://www.h-alter.org/vijesti/neoliberalna-bajanja-ostat-ce-neduhovita-sala

afflicted by secondary conditions, premature ageing and premature death. These afflictions are compounded by inadequate medical care, lack of social protection, unemployment, poverty and social isolation.

If we were, in the broadest sense, to reduce the body to various physiological processes, such as cognitive and motor functions, then it can be described as a machine that is or is not capable of performing certain tasks. Depending on how we decided to organise the society we live in, those abilities will be more or less adequate, while the tasks will be more or less exploitative. A body of a person with cancer, a body drained by factory work, a psychologically damaged body, a body that is not heard, a body fearing another body, a plethora of different bodies are faced with tasks and conditions in the workplace that do not

- s take into consideration the
- E circumstances in which those
- M bodies exist.
- В

Ε

F

F

т

н

58

Е

Ν

- L The Fifth Ensemble primarily evolved
 - from the idea of providing decent work for our fellow citizens, which we believed could take the form of artistic work in the theatre. We believed that the collective art processes were sufficiently open to allowing the circulation of various identities. Unfortunately, artistic work in the theatre is not impervious to economical processes, resulting in frequent changes of its purpose for the sake of profit, which, as it turns out, more often exploits than empowers.

Be that as it may, we still believe that the Fifth Ensemble will develop into a brilliant shadow of collective care and artistic lucidity, with the hope of ultimately preserving the right to decent work, as well as theatre itself.

elumci sa sindromon

rvu predstavu u HNK Ri

MOULZ

OSU Greativini

6

profesionalni glumci"

E

acht

SII00S 5 design... costume movement, Acting,



Minority Others: in the gap between the exotics of the object and the voice of the subject

HA)RVDIN HROMADŽI(

Let us begin this discourse with the problem motifs of national minorities, migration, and the theme of identity within the contexts of multiculturalism and cultural diversity in general. We will relate them to identity politics and political correctness, i.e. the normative principles that have been sociopolitically and culturally affirmed within the paradigm of liberal democratic capitalism of the second half of the 20th and the beginning of the 21st century. A platform thus defined will enable us to contemplate the central motif of this article, the Porto Etno Festival, which forms a part of the Kitchen of Diversity flagship of Rijeka 2020 – ECoC. We will try to critically interpret it via the concept of creative cultural industries. The final remark offers some thoughts on possible answers to such problem challenges. In all this, due to limited space, we will not be dealing with the aspects related to the current corona crisis. which have also substantially affected the implementation of the Rijeka 2020 - ECoC.

The Council of Europe adopted the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, in Strasbourg in 1994, and it entered into force in Croatia in 1998. From the legal-legislative perspective, it plays an important role. It is the first legally binding act at the international level that comprehensively protects the rights of national minorities. In 2002, the Croatian Parliament passed the Decision on the proclamation of the Constitutional Act on the Rights of National Minorities. This law specifies that members of national minorities have the right to declare their nationality, the right to use their first and last name in their language, and that these rights are officially recognised by their entry into the Register of civil status.

The latest population census of Croatia from 2011 shows that Rijeka, which is a relevant demographic within the context of the indicative theme of the article, besides being home to Croats who form the majority of the population (82.52%), is also home to 21 registered national minorities. The largest minority group are Serbs (6.57%), followed by Bosniaks/Muslims (2.06%), then Italians (1.90%) and Slovenes (0.85%).

Speaking/writing about minorities (not strictly national), in the context of modern history, indirectly means relating that problem motif to the regime of capitalist liberal democracy, but also to the issues of the so-called identity politics and political correctness directly. The concept of identity politics escalates in the era of the 1970s and the 1980s (although it's no less present today, quite the contrary), not accidentally in a period where several important transformative processes overlap: the restoration of capitalism according to the neoliberal politico-economic model, the beginning of the decline of traditional industrial production (the so-called Fordism) in the so-called West, and the related crisis of the so-called social welfare state, and the beginnings of a post-industrial (Fordist) economy (this is also the domain of cultural industries, which we will consider in more detail below), and the zenith of the culture of postmodernism.

In that sense, the concept of identity politics serves as an explanatory pattern in defence of the social and political rights of all social groups, which are deprived, that is to say, excluded according to any identity marker, be it racial, ethnic, sex/gender, religious, sexual, generational, economic class

etc. In the original phase, the politics of identity were mostly articulated within the framework of liberal-leftist initiatives and movements that arose on a wave of political and social activism, which reached their highest points in '68, only to be increasingly taken over at a later stage by civil society and human rights organisations, the sphere of the socalled non-governmental organisations, and the like. In this century, the said space has become the target of the New Right (the so-called *alt-right* movement), i.e. the neoconservative Christian associations that strive to impose a set of their own ideological values and interests.

The limits of identity politics

However, there are numerous criticisms of the identity politics model. Most often they come from the side of the traditional Left, i.e. the Marxist criticism of the political economy of capitalism, which sees the pushing of identity politics and values related to it as a radius str. 66 р

0

R

Т

0

63

Porto Etno – Festival of World Music and Gastronomy, was developed within the preparatory programme of Rijeka 2020 – European Capital of Culture

a twenty-year tradition of holding manifestation Ethno **Review – Days of Ethnic Minorities in** Rijeka. With a new, modernised look, Porto Etno – Festival of World Music and Gastronomy began life in 2017 and, in addition to the community of national minorities active in Rijeka and Primorje-Gorski Kotar County, it has also gathered together many settlers and musical nomads from throughout the world. Its programme turns the concept of the Port of diversity into a unique experience by melding indigenous scents, flavours and chants from Istria and Kvarner with those from around the globe into a vibrant recipe for a multicultural and open city.

The festival comprises music. gastronomy. folk dancing, circus and children's programmes that cater to residents of **Rijeka and their temporary** fellow citizens from Croatia, the region, Europe and the world. More than 200 musicians. delicacies from 20 world cuisines and numerous educational programmes have drawn a diverse audience, ranging from children and young people to pensioners, and in the three years it has been held, Porto Etno has travelled the entire city. from the Rikard Benčić complex to Exportdrvo, and even the Riječka Rezolucija Square in downtown Rijeka. Some of the performers have included the North East Jazz Orchestra (IT). Wicked **Dub Division (IT), Iva Bittova** (CZ), Putokazi (HR), Boban Marković Orkestar (RS). BaBa ZuLa (TR). Acid Arab (FR), JeboTon Ansambl (HR), Cinkuši (HR), EtnoRom (HU), Divanhana (BiH), BandaNera Afrobeat (SN and IT), Saba Anglana (SO), Esma's Band (MK). Širom (SI). Denise Dantas (BR), Mihaly Dresch & Antal Brasnyó (HU), Jennifer Cabrera Fernandez (MX), Karandila Gypsy Brass Orchestra (BG), Arakne Group (IT, SI, HR), Vasil Hadžimanov (RS) and Nika Solce (SI), with many of the artists having been backed by the in-house Porto Etno **Orchestra helmed by Zoran** Majstorović, the festival's music director.

practice of overemphasizing the issue from a "superstructures" worldview, while at the same time deliberately neglecting the social class problems in the economic and political "base". Therefore, the approach of this type of criticism, is to view identity politics as a kind of "fig leaf" of liberal-democratic regimes, that is to say, as the socio-cultural reverse of a coin whose obverse side is that of neoliberal capitalism.

If we apply the problem matrix of identity politics to minorities and the "experience of the other", e.g. of migrants who have largely been coming to Europe in the last few years, we will regularly encounter signifiers such as Syrians, Iragis, Afghans, Bangladeshis, or simply Muslims, or "young men"... But by simply looking at the public media perception of things, you will not encounter across such concepts as cooks, teachers, medical doctors, carpenters, artists or engineers, i.e. the names of the professions that many of these people are trained in and qualified for. So the real question would be, in the perception of the "ones", why do the "others" regularly end up being classified as ethnic, religious, gender and generational, and not into labour, social and class identities?

Akin to the discussion on identity politics is the motif of political correctness, the popularisation and spreading of which belongs to the same period, the 1970s, and is mostly connected to the American sociopolitical context and the so-called New Left. What started off as a satirical ironisation and ridicule of "rigid" language and thought, has been perverted into the current identityrelated hypersensitivity of "everyone and everything". In our advocacy of a critical approach to political correctness, we would like to emphasize the hypocrisy dimension of this model.

Political correctness treats the minority Other as a protected figure, a rare endemic phenomenon, and in terms of discourse and communication, it deals with this phenomenon tolerantly and humanely, but more often than not. this same Other remains excluded from the political, social and economic life of the Ones, when viewed from the perspective of the right to be political as the most widely understood value of social engagement and visibility. This is also what the envisioned cultural diversity in the current Croatian and European context sort of looks like, mostly interpreted in terms of the participation of all kinds of minorities in the production of traditionally and conservatively understood culture. So, they are good as long as they remain corralled within their language and identity ghetto, in a sort of (self) isolation, and its corresponding inadequacy.

Long story short, the general places tell us that Porto Etno is a Festival of World Music and Gastronomy, backed mostly by the participation of national minority communities of Rijeka, and that its origins can be traced to the Ethno Review, an event with a twentyyear tradition, where minorities have presented their culture through folklore and food, and an event that has, in terms of the audiences involved, been relatively (self)isolated. The festival produced by Rijeka 2020 – ECoC envisioned a continuation of the said tradition, as well as a developmental transformation of the festival, with the aim of attracting wider audiences and becoming a place of encounters between "old ethnic groups", i.e. the traditional national minorities of Rijeka from earlier historical periods, with more recent settlers (e.g. from the Philippines, Madagascar, China, India...). As it was worded in the advertising discourse of the programme itself on the Rijeka 2020 – ECoC website: "Porto Etno is an international festival that turns the concept of the Port of diversity into a unique experience. Rhythms, chants, flavours and scents from various cultures around the globe will make Rijeka a centre of global culture in the first weekend of September. Hundreds of musicians, around twenty world cuisines, and many educational programmes make this festival special and the best example of Rijeka's multicultural collage". At the same time, *The Kitchen* of Diversity "creates a space for the exchange of ideas and habits, as well as prejudices. It opens up the topics of migrations, connects those who came, those who are here and those who

left". So, the values of diversity, world

culture, multiculturalism, exchange,

The concept of cultural industries, on

the other hand, leads us to a traditional

migration... together, united.

reference²³ for us to realise the

0

р

0

²³ Adorno, Theodor; Horkheimer, Max. *Dialectic of Enlightenment*. Sarajevo: Veselin Masleša, 1989.


In addition to the permanent programme creators, communities of national minorities and recent arrivals from Kenya, Madagascar, Trinidad & Tobago and a number of other countries, the festival has also made other important collaborations. Members of the Addiction Help NGO VIDA Rijeka and the Centre for Rehabilitation in Rijeka helped set up the stage, while professionals from Hotel Jadran and pupils from the Catering School Opatija cooked at the festival. Porto Etno has also made its programme and locations accessible to people with disabilities.

processes of interesting reformulations of original meanings and interpretations of this concept. Generally speaking, the so-called Frankfurt School of critical theory²⁴ develops a kind of a political economy of culture, which can be boiled down to the thesis that the production and distribution of cultural products flow within the domain of a specific economic system – capitalism that is formed in its complexity through a network of relations between the state, private owners of the production inputs, of mass media, social institutions and of everyday life practices. During the 1960s and 1970s, along with the increasingly intense interactions of culture, society and business, and simultaneously with the first glimpses of the transformation of the economic and social model of Europe and North America from industrial into post-industrial production models, the original concept/ term cultural industry and its meanings are increasingly being critically observed with the clear intention to reformulate the singular form of this concept into a plural one – cultural industries. This is particularly the case with some sociologists such as Morin²⁵, Miège and Garnham²⁶.

"Multi-culti" Lost in the Matrix

In 1979 and 1980, when a comprehensive process of sponsoring a wider platform of comparative international project

programmes united under the umbrella term of cultural industries was started under the auspices of UNESCO, it then became clear that this event had brought to life a new paradigm, which remains current to this day within the framework of the cultural policies of EU countries. During the 1980s, and particularly the 1990s, together with the growth of neoliberalism in politics and economics, as well as the dominance of the postmodern socio-cultural logic of late capitalism, it has become overwhelmingly clear that cultural industries are becoming one of the leading agents of economic, social and cultural changes, as well as a model of understanding the transformations in other industries. Consequently, the "creative economy"²⁷ becomes a hot topic in the manner of a sort of a "self-help" lesson. The British Office for Creative Industries, formed in 1997 within the framework of the Cool Britannia project, as part of

the Department for Culture, Media and Sport (DCMS), has defined cultural creative industries as "those industries that originate from individual creativity, abilities and talent, and that have the potential to create wealth and employment by generating and leveraging intellectual property".28

Everything said thus far makes it clear that **cultural creativity** and innovation in the last forty years, which roughly coincides with the history of the European Capital of Culture project, are being more closely linked to the spirit of entrepreneurship and market competitiveness.

It is therefore necessary to gain some insight into the issue, motivated by a critique of the capitalist political economy of cultural industries, so that we can make sense of the scale of this matrix. In the context of the example being dealt with in this article, it is important to emphasize that what most often appears under the buzzword of creative cultural industries is the mere branding of already existing capacities in the domains of cultural productions combined with the legacy of cultural-historical heritage that this matrix leans on, thus once again witnessing the model of socalled public-private partnership (long story short, it means shuffling public money into private pockets), and a commodification of public goods whose performative and effectual logic is readily evident: the degradation of the public, non-commercial offer, with the simultaneous consolidation

р

0

R

Т

0

71

Е

Т

Ν

0

They are philosophers and sociologists from the Institute for Social Research, which was founded in 1923 as an independent research centre forming a part of the University of Frankfurt. The Institute brought together intellectuals of Marxist provenance and, apart from the aforementioned Theodore Adorno and Max Horkheimer, also present were Herbert Marcuse, Walter Benjamin, Leo Löwenthal... Considering the fact that these were mostly people of Jewish descent, the Institute was moved from Frankfurt to New York in 1933, immediately after Hitler's rise to power in Germany. Morin, Edgar. L'esprit du temps. Essai sur la culture de masse. Paris: Grasset-Fasquelle, 1962.

Miège, Bernard; Garnham, Nicholas. "The Cultural Commodity". Media, Culture & Society 1 (3) 1979, pp. 297-311.

²⁷ Howkins, John. Creative Economy: How People Make Money from Ideas.
²⁸ New York: Allen Lane Penguin Books, 2001.
²⁸ Lazarin, Branimira. "Cool Hrvatska". *Novosti*, online edition, 13 December 2005,

accessed on 22 August 2020. https://www.portalnovosti.com/cool-hrvatska

and strengthening of the private, commercial sector in the field of culture, which is a phenomenon being dealt with for years in the weekly newspaper *Novosti (News)* and on some non-profit domestic web portals by author and theoretician Boris Postnikov. The creative cultural industries and their privileged protagonists marked by exclusivism and elitism should also be added to the mix.

Rijeka 2020 – ECoC, as was the case with all the other European Capitals of Culture thus far, has a clearly defined agenda in line with the described principles of cultural and creative industries, structured within the domains of the logic of a capitalist concept of culture. This brings us to the first possible level of the problem, to a kind of "systemic castration" of the programmes in terms of what they're

like (what they want to be like?) – here,

р

0

R

Т

0

72

- **E** in particular, the *Kitchen of Diversity*,
- T the Porto Etno festival and other
- N related Rijeka 2020 ECoC flagships.
 O Simply put, the matrix of cultural
 - Simply put, the matrix of cultural politics and creative industries has been set up in the way of the European Capitals of Culture – the one that, to once again briefly paraphrase the words of the Frankfurters in this context, contributes to the capitalist takeover of culture – deprives culture of its universal and humanistic, emancipatory and enlightened values, and to a greater or lesser extent commodifies, transfigures and transforms it into

commercially saleable consumer goods. On another note, in the guidelines and implementations of programmes such as the *Kitchen of Diversity* and the Porto Etno festival, and based on having read the Birmingham cultural studies²⁹ and

the interpretations pertaining thereto, an idea is being advocated that culture can and should be something other than a mere commodity: the idea of culture as a battlefield for the emancipation of the socio-politically and economically oppressed, excluded, forgotten, marginalised and a space where their voices can be heard.

But, of course, in practical terms, this is impossible and cannot be achieved in the framework of a programme such as the ECoC. Big words with almost revolutionary connotations courage, peculiarity, progressivity, libertarianism... – as value postulates etched in large letters into the broad programme platform of Rijeka 2020 -ECoC, have very little meaning when they strive to achieve the main goal of the entire event, "the creation of audiences", an uninventive concept that has demonstrated all its futility across Europe. The concept has, for years now, been noted and criticised for its exclusively competitive agenda

of creating consumers in the field of culture, while at the same time acting under the motto of "inclusion, polyphony, participation, democratisation" and their related principles, thus creating nothing but hypocrisy. The result of this tension - a sort of a negative dialectic, in terms of the underlying motif of this text – is that national minorities still remain "corralled" within a sort of a folklore-gastro-musical "sheepfold", in the identity of producers of delicious flavours, seductive rhythms and rhythmic dances. As such, they create the general impression of a multi-culti diverse community and attractiveness, thus creating the alluring effect of an exotic tourist destination and contributing to the potential of making a profit, but the distinguishable voice of the sociopolitical presence, engagement and inclusion of the said "others" is still acutely missing.

When the view is clearer from the margins

Something like that could perhaps be possible and feasible within the frameworks of politics that are anti-hegemonic, i.e. anti-capitalist politics that would act in the spirit of a radical utopian gesture, an affirmative 'provocation'. Along those lines, yet sticking to the theme, let us imagine the unimaginable scenario: a situation where the ECoC budget money would be redirected into Rijeka's shipbuilding industry.



²⁹ The Centre for Contemporary Cultural Studies of the University of Birmingham (CCCS), was established in 1964 by Richard Hoggart (with associates Stuart Hall, Raymond Williams, Edward P. Thompson...) and it is, in some aspects, considered a sort of a continuation of the tradition based on Neo-Marxist ideas of the Critical theory of society of the Frankfurt School.

Then, for the purpose of "threading through the needle's eye" of EU and domestic bureaucracy - in the sense of justifying the financial costs before all kinds of project evaluators – 3. maj as a company could, for a brief moment, be transformed into an arts and crafts artisanal co-op. The Ministry of Culture would make sure that the shipyard workers get the status of freelance artists for a year and shipbuilding would be viewed as the implementation of an arts project. This imaginary example is reminiscent of one of the larger projects initiated as part of the Rijeka 2020 -ECoC - the reconstruction of Tito's ship, the "Galeb" – which we will not be dealing with in great detail herein, as it belongs to another flagship ("Seasons of Power"). However, the association is both interesting and relevant, in that the ship's refurbishment project (safely envisioned along the lines of the mainstream model of the EU policy of condemning "all totalitarian regimes") with its great symbolic and historical

relevance, is taking place in a city that has, during the last few years, been going through the final stages of the decline of decades of its reputable industrial past, where the death of the shipbuilding industry is merely the final act of the tragedy. The Question that begs to be answered is why a city – once the stage of a bad political experiment in the sense of an original version of fascism – cannot envision and try to implement a radical project aimed at its own revitalisation, naturally, with other, left-wing social and labour, minority affirmative ideological premises. Of course, the historical contexts differ significantly, but we ourselves do influence and co-create the historical

situations. For something like that to happen, some of the big words used in the programme platform of Rijeka 2020 – ECoC - the aforementioned courage, peculiarity, progressivity and libertarianism – should "here" and "there" be turned into actions. As should the audacity in the sense of political imagination and the willingness to take action.

Where and what are the possible answers to the challenges outlined thus far? We support the idea that an alternative minority identity, in its different forms, can also affirm the

marginalised. Because, in a certain sense, being displaced to the margins of society actually opens up a space of broadness, freedom, and a space that sometimes provides a better view of the situation than the hub of society. If we want to look for an institutional example of affirming a national minority in Croatia, it could be the weekly newspaper *Novosti* mentioned above, which is published under the national minority label (its publisher is the Serb National Council). Even though this media outlet nominally falls under the provisions of Article 18 of the Constitutional Act on The **Rights of National Minorities, which** deals with the media and defines various rights and obligations, such as broadcasting shows in the languages of national minorities or the participation of national minority associations in the creation of a programme geared towards national minorities, Novosti do not limit themselves to such definitions and prescribed tasks, although they do

It is a "minority" that enters the space of the "majority" in a conscious and combative manner, with a voice, an articulation, and from the viewpoint of the marginalised, it becomes a socio-political subject and thus also consciously and actively participates in progressively changing its society.

satisfy them too, among others. Quite

the contrary, here we can clearly see

subject, which is as such, becoming a

factor of social politization.

What is the philosophical, ontological and existential background for such something else: an engaged public media possibilities? We would like to say that a positive step towards attempting to surpass limitations – and within the context of the presented problem motifs, identity registers of "minority" and "majority", "us" and "them", the "ones" and the "others" – is the direction of a radically utopian, universally humanistic gesture. This

is about the plural that arises out of the connection with the singular, then surpasses it, but also destroys it. Actually, each singularity already carries inside, in its very essence, the embryo of plurality. which is a line of thought along the lines of Nancy's concept of singularplural being³⁰: the self-production of a political community that is shaped at the connection between the singular (the individual) and the plural (unity, the state). Given the fact that each community is a fiction constituted around lack, the holes in the symbolic structure of the normative policy of social reality, we are left with the experience of coexisting with others that, according to Nancy's firm belief, can rest upon the principles of rational consensus and the experience of understanding.

р

0

R

Т

0

75

Ξ

Т

Ν

0

³⁰ Nancy, Jean-Luc. Two Essays – The Inoperative Community/On Being Singular Plural. Zagreb: Multimedia Institute, 2004.

S m C U A

How Rijeka, even by hand-sewing flags for the central square in Zagreb, remained a vanguard of the

rainbow movement

Rainbow flags are a strong symbol of visibility and the struggle of the LGBTIQ+ movement and community. Displaying them is more than a mere ritualistic gesture or a sign that a space or event is a venue for queer gatherings and liberties. The flags are a political act of resistance and pride. Waving or painting them often becomes performance art. So, it is no coincidence that the Croatian LGBTIQ+ movement went to great lengths to raise their flags in the streets and squares, public buildings and, as strange as it may sound, in the safe spaces of the gueer community. Initially, the activists sometimes even had to plead with the gay clubs to allow them to display a few rainbow stickers for the sake of marking and empowering the space and indicating that it is more than a "regular" discotheque.

But the real struggle was to have the flags displayed in Zagreb's central square. The Zagreb Pride collective decided on visibility as the theme of the 6th Pride FRANKO DOTA, PhD

Parade in 2007, which is both the essence and purpose of every Pride Parade. That year, the communique stated the following: "Visibility, the symbolic take-over of public space and the political message that it conveys, are some of the crucial moments of empowerment for individuals, both male and female, who espouse an LGBTIQ+ identity, and a means to send out a symbolic and concrete message to the public that we exist, as well as to publicly and transparently display the needs and to advocate the rights of many people in our country (...). One way to achieve this is to symbolically take over the city and its public spaces, its neuralgic point, the "spica" (downtown) and Cvjetni Square, which is a symbol of Zagreb, and to an extent, of the Croatian public."³¹ In addition to having the gathering take place in Cvjetni Square, the busiest area in downtown Zagreb, instead of Zrinievac, which is somewhat bereft of the city's hustle and bustle, Zagreb Pride decided to display rainbow flags in Ban Jelačić Square for the first time.

³¹ "Vidljivost: pravo na javnost LGBTIQ osoba" ("Visibility: the right of LGBTIQ persons to be public"), Communique by the Zagreb Pride Organising Committee, Zagreb Pride Association archives, Zagreb, 26 June 2007. After dutifully filing a request with the competent office, we had to deal with bureaucratic stalling, since the City of Zagreb did not explicitly refuse having the flags displayed and instead made various tenuous excuses. Only after Pride had angrily addressed the media, inviting the citizens of Zagreb who reside along the parade route to display flags on the balconies and windows, were we able to force the City Council to grant us permission. Four rainbow flags, which had been hand-sewn because it was impossible to buy or borrow them at the time. were hoisted on flagpoles in the main national square early in the morning of 4 July 2007.³² That this was more than just another event was evidenced by the fact that the cranking of the handle at the base of the flagpole and the slow raising of the flag was broadcast live on several television channels. Next year, the scene was enhanced with a little subversive show: the second raising of the rainbow flag was accompanied by LeZbor's rendition of the Croatian anthem! Some were baffled because the rainbow and Our Beautiful supposedly do not mix very well; however Večernji List's conservative columnist ultimately reached the conclusion that this proved

that lesbians and gays are proud Croats, thus somehow "protecting Croatian honour".³³

Rainbow scarves on "Croatian men"

The ice has been broken and adorning Croatia in rainbow colours has become a custom and a tradition, one that does not just apply to the city's flagpoles and ceremonial masts. **The queer** youth guerrilla a.k.a. kugA, which is short for Cultural Street Gay Action (Kulturno-Ulična Gej Akcija), went on a night quest to decorate about 20 statues of "great men" from Croatian history and culture with neckerchiefs and

SCARVES, ranging from Ruđer Bošković at Zrinjevac to Stjepan Radić at the top of Petrinjska Street.³⁴ The following year, for a few hours, the water in six of the fountains in downtown Zagreb was coloured with eco-friendly dye (of course), to avoid damage.³⁵ S

Μ

0

Q

U

Α

79

³⁵ Đurin, Sanja. "Queer aktivizam i transformacija grada" ("Queer activism and the transformation of the city"), p. 90. "Šest zagrebačkih fontana obojano u dugine boje" ("Six Zagreb fountains in rainbow colours"). *Libela*, 15 October 2009, accessed on 13 August 2020. https://www.libela.org/vijesti/986-sest-zagrebackih-fontana-obojano-u-dugine-boje/

³² "Gay flag in Jelačić Square". Dnevnik.hr, online edition, 4 July 2007, accessed on 13 August 2020. https://dnevnik.hr/vijesti/hrvatska/gay-zastava-na-jelacicevom-trgu.html.

³³ Ivkošić, Milan. "Pubertetlije na čelu Francuske i Europske unije" ("Adolescents at the helm of France and the EU"). Večernji list, online edition, 4 July 2008, accessed on 13 August 2020. https://www.vecernji.hr/pubertetlije-na-celu-francuske-i-europske-unije-841765

³⁴ Đurin, Sanja. "Queer aktivizam i transformacija grada: kako se LGBTIQ zajednica bori za svoje prostore u gradu Zagrebu" ("Queer activism and the transformation of the city: how the LGBT community struggles to have its own space in Zagreb"). Narodna umjetnost, Vol. 55 No. 2, 2018, p. 90. "Obilježen 'Coming Out' dan" ("Coming Out Day celebrated"). H-Alter, 11 October 2008, accessed on 13 August 2020. http://www.h-alter.org/vijesti/obiljezen-coming-out-dan



by the Lesbian Organisation Rijeka (LORI) in partnership with the PaRiter association, the Women Citizens to Their City platform and the Centre for Women's Studies at the Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences in Rijeka. It is a fusion of art and activism, Since 2017, the Festival of Queer and Feminist Culture Smoqua has been organised

panel discussions, workshops, plays, study presentations, drag shows, performances etc. The festival has allowed the audience (Finland/Germany) with her extravagant act "Trouble", Mavi Veloso (Brazil/Netherlands), Ruth Borgfjord (Romania), Boryana Friends" by the Scottish director deconstruction through various performances by Lau Lukkarila which in its first three editions, countries on three continents, activities, such as exhibitions, at the works of several artists, has brought together dozens such as "Body Dialectics" by the amazing Kris Grey (SAD), the dynamic drag king show Tristan Aitchison, with guest in Croatia to get a first peek of participants from over 20 Eclipse (Belgium/France) or with the aim of challenging the poignant film "Sidney & public space interventions, in its contemplation and prejudice and engaging Rossa (USA/Bulgaria)...



81

S

Back in 2004, as part of the festival of queer culture and art, Queer Zagreb used Silvio Vujičić's installation to paint in rainbow colours the pedestrian crossing in Starčević Square, outside the building of the Zagreb City Library.³⁶

The flags were, of course, taken down, torn and burned every year. Defacing coloured fabric had become habitual in Zagreb, and had especially taken root in Split, where it was practically a folk custom.

Split's LGBTIQ+ community spent years haggling with the City Council over receiving permission to raise the rainbow

³⁶ Vujičić, Silvio. Zebra, 2004, accessed on 13 August 2020.

www.silviovujicic.com/1%20works/zebraantestarcevicsguare.html

flag in Mateiuška. But. sometimes the tearing and burning of flags is just what the doctor ordered. Seeing as how over the past 15 years or so, they have become a somewhat regular fixture of Croatian everyday life in late spring, the act of taking them down has acquired added cultural and political value. Passers-by who do not pay attention to them anymore have to notice them once they are burned or torn. This is why they are still a symbol of visibility, resistance and pride for the LGBTIQ+ community, as well as a smooth interplay between activists, the city council, homophobic vandals and the police.

On the other hand, Rijeka is and always has been

an anomaly, using flags to create its counter-narratives or at least to counter Split

and Zagreb. Rainbow colours first appeared on the balcony of the city council at Korzo in 2013, without any haggling or wrangling. The Mayor of Rijeka Vojko Obersnel, along with Ljudevit Gaj, Nikola Tesla and Ivan Mažuranić, whose bronze personifications donned rainbow scarves at the initiative of kugA, is for now the only Croatian man who has placed it around his neck himself as a guest at a queer-themed event. Even the most famous performance with elements of provocative acrobatics, centring on

37 "Riječki HNK postao LGBT kazalište: 'Heteroseksualnost je opijum za narod''' ("Croatian National Theatre in Rijeka becomes LGBT theatre: 'Heterosexuality is opium for the people'''). I. T., CroL, 8 October 2014, accessed on 13 August 2020. https://www.crol.hr/index.php/politika-aktivizam/6158-rijeki-hnk-postao-lgbt-kazaliteheteroseksualnost-je-opijum-za-narod

the LGBT flag, occurred in Rijeka. On the erstwhile Independence Day on 8 October 2015, Oliver Frljić, who was theatre manager at the time, decided to rename the central theatre in Rijeka as the "Croatian LGBT Theatre Ivan pl. Zajc" and display the rainbow flag on the facade. "This symbolic renaming gesture", as the theatre explained at the time, "is only the initial attempt made by the Croatian National Theatre in Rijeka to confirm that the pre-modifier 'national' in its name refers to a meeting place for all citizens, regardless of social status, ethnicity, education, age, religion and gender and sexual identity".37

▶ str. 85

U A

S

Μ

0

Q



82

And this is the festival in chronological order

visitors from Rijeka, other parts of Croatia and countries from the region, while the excellent turnouts and the interest was the first regional festival of queer and feminist culture in Rijeka. It exceeded all expectations by drawing in several hundred as the theme. This Free? Truly We Are Smoqua_1 took place from 12 to 14 October 2017 with shown by the

as well as guests 2, whic festival was give continued in the addressed issue encompassed by the title Pride an was held from 1 an international scheduled from programmes in Smoqua 3 was to 19 May 2018 audience, years to come. ce. The 2019 and had from abroad, **Croatian and** flavour, with 23 to 25 May Smoqua_ English. Prejudi local



with all the festival features aimed at questioning these notions. theme of Norm, Normativity,

the overarching

Criminal charges were filed against the theatre manager for breaching the Act on the Coat of Arms, Flag and Anthem of the Republic of Croatia, on the grounds that it stipulates that bank holidays are celebrated by displaying the Croatian national flag. However, on that day, the C-LGBT-T Ivan pl. Zajc wanted to be less of a national and more of a people's theatre, so it added a portion of the people to its name and waved the peoples' rainbow flags.

Pride void for "never again"

Just like the rainbow flags, pride parades, as they are commonly known, or "gay parades", which is a less frequent moniker, are more than a mere political act. They are a cultural event, as well as play that is equally directed and improvised. This is another instance of Rijeka being a vanguard within the context of Croatia, since it does not have and has not had any Pride Parades, although they could have been held there without any fanfare.

In 2021, Zagreb will host the 20th LGBTIQ+ Pride Parade, thus firmly embedding this event in the historical and cultural landscape of the capital as potential intangible national heritage that should soon be protected. Split has made it to ten, and even Osijek paraded once in rainbow colours. Whether Rijeka needs a Pride parade and when and how it will take place is up to the queer community in Rijeka to decide. From Zagreb's perspective, there is something particularly refreshing about the fact that there is a city in Croatia that has not held any Pride Parades, although it could have, without any resistance or violence, as it seems. Still, it is good to have this positive Rijeka void and to save it for "never again".

The history of sexuality and the struggle for sexual rights in 20th century Europe has taught us all too well that this emancipation was neither linear nor constantly progressive. Periods of progress and permissiveness, even emancipation and revolutionary fervour, alternated with conservative involution and reaction, leading to revived and enhanced repressiveness, which was often accompanied by vigorous persecution. Magnus Hirschfeld, or the vibrant night lesbian and gay cabaret scene in Weimar-era Berlin, could hardly have predicted what would befall them in 1933, following the Nazis' rise to power. In May of 1933, Hirschfeld's Institute for Sexual Science was one of the first to be ransacked by the Nazi student youth, then shut down and swiftly banned. while the books held therein were publicly burned. Hirschfeld staved alive by pure happenstance, because he was outside Berlin at the time – a place he could no longer return to, and he died in exile in France in 1935.³⁸

³⁸ Whisnant, Clayton J. Queer Identities and Politics in Germany: A History, 1880–1945. New York: Harrington Park Press. 2016, p. 210.

Magnus, the first Yugoslav gay and lesbian activist collective, which was formed in Ljubljana in 1984 as a "cultural organisation for the socialisation of

homosexuality", was named after this sexology pioneer and gay and trans emancipation activist. Its first step into the public eve was the organisation of a cultural event with film screenings, a gay non-fiction exhibition, round table discussions, the first official queer party in Yugoslavia and a special edition of Viks magazine entitled "Homosexuality and Culture".³⁹ In other words, the gueer movement in this region actually started as a cultural event. It soon evolved into a political movement after the 4th issue of Magnus was banned under the guise of concern over the AIDS epidemic spreading among male homosexuals, but in reality because the Magnus team scheduled their festival for 25 May or Youth Day, as well as the birthday of the late Josip Broz Tito.40

2013, a hapless year for Croatia, was, of course, a far cry from Germany in 1933; however, the referendum on the preventive ban of same-sex marriage deeply affected and disturbed the Croatian activist scene and the LGBTIQ+ community. Of course, it was difficult to see this coming, as it was also the only such referendum that passed in a European country. We entered then into a new, more involutionary and defensive era for Croatian queer activism. Still. you could say that the referendum backfired to an extent for those who had organised it, although they are still unaware of this. The Pride Parade that was held in Zagreb that year had the largest turnout, while the collection of signatures and the campaign preceding the referendum sparked the greatest coming out yet, ranging from discussions about voting at family lunches to TV shows. In July 2014, the passed Act on Same-Sex Life Partnership ultimately turned out to be much better and more comprehensive than anything that had been unofficially indicated and officially promoted by Zoran Milanović's government prior to the referendum. Rijeka was the only major Croatian city besides Pula to vote against with 59.3%. Maybe it is not such a bad idea to have Rijeka and its pride parades as a safe backup for when things get tense elsewhere, so that the main parade could be moved to the free Kvarner if marching through Zagreb is no longer a viable option.

Rijeka may not have a Pride Parade, but what it does have is two genuine little queer gems: the Lori girls and their Smoqua. **Not many people know that the first LGBT**

organisation to be founded in Croatia was LORI or the Lesbian Organisation Rijeka. The association was established on 19 October 2000, before the Kontra Lesbian Association (March 2002) and Iskorak (January 2002). Following the foundation of two organisations in Zagreb, public focus immediately shifted to them, especially because they announced the first Pride Parade in spring of 2002, which then took place on 29 June under the motto of "Stepping Out Against Prejudice". However, it was LORI that made headlines with the first anti-homophobia campaign in Croatia or, as it was officially named, the Campaign for Promoting the Rights of Homosexuals. The video "Love Is Love" became a national sensation. During its prophetic 40 seconds, the video addressed and emphasised almost all the issues that Croatian LGBTIQ+ activists would need to tackle in the next twenty years: family unacceptance, social exclusion, work discrimination and the fear of being laid off upon disclosing one's sexual orientation in a homophobic work environment, invisibility in public spaces, exposure to violence and the struggle for the equality of marriage.⁴¹ And everything would have been just fine, had the Croatian Radiotelevision not practically banned the video by refusing to air it despite agreeing to do so beforehand.⁴² It seems that the national broadcaster was perturbed by the last scene in which two lesbian women in white wedding dresses joyously embrace each other after seemingly having said "yes", while their guests shower them with traditional confetti.



S

М

0

³⁹ Velikonja, Nataša. *Dvajset let gejevskega in lezbičnega gibanja* (Twenty Years of the Gay and Lesbian Movement). Ljubljana: ŠKUC, 2004, p. 9.

⁴⁰ Kuhar, Roman. Topla braća, hvala ne! Historija slovenskog gej i lezbijskog pokreta (Pansies, no thanks! History of the Gay and Lesbian Movement). In Čitanka LGBT ljudskih prava (LGBT Human Rights Reader), 2nd amended edition (edited by Aida Spahić and Saša Gavrić). Sarajevo: SOC, 2012, p. 127-128.

⁴¹ Love Is Love, Campaign for Promoting the Rights of Homosexuals, Lesbian Organisation Rijeka, 2002.

^{42 &}quot;Jasna Ulaga-Valić zabranila emitiranje lezbijskog spota" ("Jasna Ulaga-Valić bans lesbian video"). Index.hr, 4 February 2003, accessed on 13 August 2020. https://www.index.hr/magazin/clanak/jasna-ulagavalic-zabranila-emitiranjelezbijskog-spota/116494.aspx

The nascent activist period was so discreet that they shied away from showing two same-sex people kiss, so the girls only got to hug each other instead. But even the wedding embrace was disturbing for Croatian Radiotelevision. The previous scenes depicting sorrow and fear could probably have been aired at a later time, but the joy and happiness of two lesbians was simply overwhelming for the thinskinned Croatian Radiotelevision. Twenty years later, the prudish censorship seems so barren and empty since today it is barely possible to buy a foreign TV show that does not feature lesbian or gay romance.

Q U A 88

S

Μ

0

And at the end of the triad – plays

The Lori girls have become the focal point not just of Rijeka, but also of the Croatian LGBTIQ+ scene, as well as culture. They have educated journalists, the parents of LBTIQ+ children and youth, empowered transgender people, advocated and built a more open and tolerant society... And gueer art has always been important to LORI: With a series of three forum-theatre plays that were created in cooperation with the Alarm group, they visited seven cities from 2007 to 2012, again addressing issues that had been hinted at in such a colourful way in the "Love Is Love" campaign – family acceptance in "Will Things **Change If I Tell Them That** I'm Gay?", discrimination in various areas of life and the challenges of coming out in

"Within My Own Four Walls" and being transgender in "Walking in the Shoes of My

Gender". With its interactive stage character, the forum-theatre has also enabled the performer and the audience to participate because at one point, they switch their usual places in order to break up one-way communication, meaning that a member of the audience goes on stage and immerses him- or herself in the drama, takes on the role, in this case, of a young gay man, lesbian or transgender person in violent or hostile surroundings. There have also been numerous film and literary evenings and exhibitions, and since recently, even poetry readings at Kvir poetRI. Plays and exhibitions make up culture, but so do themed parties, especially if we are aware of the formative role that queer clubs, nightlife and safe spaces for socialising with music and dancing, from San Francisco to Moscow, played in constructing lesbian, gay and trans identities and communities in the 20th century. People would come to the parties at Discordia all the way from Zagreb and Ljubljana, while the Queer-UP gettogethers fill, to an extent, the void that LGBT entrepreneurship has failed to accomplish in Rijeka and most other cities.

And finally, the fig on top is without a doubt Smoqua, the festival of queer and feminist culture, which has brought artists, LGBT intellectuals and theorists to Rijeka since 2017, providing a space for "sharing ideas, knowledge and works" through meetings with Rijeka's cultural and queer community.

Twenty years of the LORI girls also means twenty years of (second-wave) Croatian LGBTIQ+ activism, because the one that started in the late 80s with the establishment of Lila Inicijativa, the first lesbian group in Zagreb, followed by LIGMA and other organisations from the 90s, failed to survive in the atmosphere of war, nationalism and the strong retraditionalisation of society. These twenty years have been marked by flags, parades and plays. Behind this triad stands the formation of our queer communities and LGBT identities; political and activist struggles for a better society, less discrimination and legal equality; and, of course, the rise of gueer art and culture. Neither Rijeka nor the LGBTIQ+ community could have done it without the LORI girls.



B MARINA TKAL(I(

What can be achieved through art in a turbulent age where migration is a fact of life

92

С

Н

Α

Ν

G

Е

Risk Change is a project that has, within the sphere of contemporary visual art, tried to shed new light on the topic of migration and make it more present and visible under the slogan "Migration is a natural law. Everything moves, everybody migrates". Its inception coincided with intensified migration flows induced by wars, politics, a supranational political economy and the climate crisis, which are all conducive to the view of Europe as a continent

of migrants. In such a constellation of world events, the art programme of the project has proven to be a very hot topic. "Inspired by local experiences and the current processes of political destabilisation, we have set up the **Risk Change project at the intersection** between official history and left out or suppressed narratives, scattered between the abandoned model of the welfare state and its globalised

derivative with its loosened legal safeguards", Ksenia Oreli and Sabina Salamon point out in their text "It Would Actually Be Crazy to Stay Here* – Risk Change Exhibitions"⁴³.

By setting up primarily international group exhibitions at the Museum of Modern and Contemporary Art in Rijeka, and encouraging the diversity of artistic expressions, through this project, we tried to affirm migration as a general principle and explore their real and fictional possibilities that go beyond the reach of given boundaries. For example, the exhibitions "Escape" and "Black Disguises" thematised the efforts towards achieving a better life, their denial through bio/necropolitical measures, such as neo-colonialism, xenophobia and expulsions of migrants from the borders. Border zones thus represented the key topoi in both exhibition episodes. Throughout the last of the exhibitions, "We're Not Like Them", we dealt with the conceptions through which we form an image of another person, aside from the issue of how others see us. Instead of placing an emphasis on individual positions, the exhibition pointed out the issue of otherness as a political issue founded on the privileges of the elite compared to the (outsider) minority, depending on who is in the position of a subject that can speak.

All these exhibition contexts bring us to the question of the role of art in the current socio-political developments and relations. Guided by Zabel's distinction of "political" versus "autonomous art"⁴⁴, throughout the Risk Change project,

we ask the question of what is the role of art within the context of socially engaged artistic activities?

Borders vs. the right to revolt

The questioning of the role and power of art in active, socially engaged, critical activities certainly implies that contemporary art acts within a capitalist system and free-market relations. It does not present itself as a free entity, untarnished by bureaucratic traps and obstacles. Therefore, during the exhibition "We're Not Like Them", an important question arose in our minds: how and to what extent are the mechanisms of control projected into the field of art, exhibiting and curatorial practice? In the context of cultural and artistic activities, we witness a subjection of the field to a system of rules and supervisions when it comes to production within either European or national projects, most of which ultimately conform to global standards. These are rules that, on the one hand, generate a competitive spirit guided by the idea of business excellence wherein the only rule is the survival of the fittest, while on the other hand, they pose a

threat to the idea of trust and solidarity in human exchange, as well as creative diversification. In what way can art, within a system interwoven with diverse rules and the complex of excellence and exclusivity, respond to these limitations and affirm its right to rebellion? Assuming that the order of things also reflects their intended purpose, is art able to circumvent the mechanisms that generate inequalities and cumbersome rules, while producing a different kind of content and positive values? Doesn't today's system present itself as an exclusive bureaucratic conglomerate that is separate from the real field of work and hierarchically superior to the fractional and fragmented operation of many cultural and art initiatives and/or institutions?

What art can actually do within the vortex of global political turmoil is raise awareness and warn of specific social injustices. In any event, the question of whether art even has the potential to initiate social transformation in the turmoil of recent developments does seem more important than ever, and demands a clearer expression. Finally, during the 4-year development of the Risk Change project's programme, the thesis of Thomas Hirschhorn proved to be a valued conclusion: "Doing art politically means working for the other".45

str. 98

93

⁴³ Orelj, Ksenija; Salamon, Sabina. "It Would Actually Be Crazy to Stay Here* – Risk Change Exhibitions." Between Mobility Control and Social Transformation: Art/Interdisciplinary project Risk Change / Edited by Ksenija Orelj, Sabina Salamon, Marina Tkalčić. Rijeka: Museum of Modern and Contemporary Art, Rijeka, 2020, pp. 278-283. 44

Zabel, Igor. Contemporary Art Theory. Edited by Igor Španjol. Zurich: JRP | Ringier, 2012. Hirschhorn, Thomas. "Doing Art Politically: What Does This Mean?" (2008) In: Ethics. Documents of Contemporary 45 Art. London: Whitechapel Gallery; Cambridge, Massachusetts: The MIT Press, 2015, pp. 108-109.

R

Four Years of Networki

Migration is a natural law, everything moves, everybody migrates.

(project motto)

 \mathbf{O}

Vojvodina (Novi Sad), RIXC - Centre grants from the Ministry of Culture (Budapest), ZINC - Arts et Cultures Risk Change is a European project of the Republic of Croatia and the City of Rijeka. It was implemented Social Inclusion in Malta (Zejtun), Foundation for the Promotion of X-OP (Maribor) and the National operator, MMSU - The Museum and Kapodistrian University of Athens. It developed within the co-financed within the Creative from May 2016 to August 2020, Museum of Contemporary Art Takomat GmBH (Köln), FOPSIM and it involved the cooperation Art of Rijeka, ACAX - Agency for Numériques (Marseille), MSUV Europe EU programme, and by of ten international partners: KID KIBLA (Maribor) as project Modern and Contemporary for New Media Culture (Riga), Contemporary Art Exchange of

create and promote contemporary The ultimate goal of the project is to build a network of connections linked to contemporary migration processes and the constant social century. The project also strived processes, and these goals were primarily realised in the form of of Culture, and during its 4-year European interdisciplinary art, and to link it with social studies, applied sciences and migration. integration of cultural diversity to create new practices geared and cultural change in the 21st Rijeka 2020 - European Capital implementation, we strived to between the migrants and the towards making the audiences an integral part of the creative exhibitions, four of which took Kitchen of Diversity flagship of setting up international group ocals, striving towards the place at the MMSU:

Between There and There: Anatomy of Temporary Migration (2016.)

oject events n explorative roject on the mmunities as/the grand een Mobility Control and Social Transformation Project Risk orm for ŝ 6 workshops, symposiums, and talks, we announced open call for collaborative programmes * We're Not Like Them (20 /elling ducatio ised a atf Black Disguises (2017.) state of the minority **co** in Croatia. An online p nationwide research p - Art/Interdisciplinary Change^{"47}. and conducted a large was also set in ⁴⁶, and reader entitled "Betw the dissemination of finale of the project, host of solo and tra artist residencies, e We have also organ * Escape (2018.)

The online platform is available in English at https://riskchangeproject.wordpress.com/
 The reader is fully available at https://issuu.com/rijekammsu/docs/c_itanka

Everyone look for happiness, but not every happiness is the same / And everyone will die / But not every death is same either / Not every death is mourned. Lana Čmajčanin





The foreigner comes in when the consciousness of arises, and he disappears when we all acknowledge unamenable to bonds and communities.

my difference as foreigners, Julia Kristeva

111

110

ALL ALLERAN LIANCE DE LEBE

This conclusion can very subtly be represented in two artworks/ installations showcased at the international exhibition "We're Not Like Them". One is a video work entitled "The Snail Project" (2018) by a young artist from Banja Luka, Danilo Milovanović, and the other is a multi-channel installation called "Fragments I: Where Stories Cut Across the Land" (2015 – 2018) by the Albanian author living in Berlin, Vangjush Vellahu.

Omnipresent, yet completely marginalised

Danilo Milovanović implemented his "The Snail Project" in Poland during 2018, while he was there at an artist's residency. In Katowice, he met a local homeless man Mirek, who is also the main protagonist of the story. While following his marginal urban everyday life, the video serves as a record of the common ludic endeavour of transforming a newly-acquired lorry into Mirek's temporary abode and shelter, and Milovanović also disclosed some details regarding the realisation of the project in a mini interview with us.

Why is your video work called "The Snail Project"? What is the link between a snail and the homeless man Mirek as the main protagonist of a film? Mirosław, or Mirek, has for years been living the life of a nomad in the city of Katowice, using abandoned cars as his temporary homes. The name of the project clearly arises from the association with a snail shell, which in this case refers to Mirosław and the way he relates to the concept of a "house". This was probably my primary association when, at an impromptu local parking lot, I saw Mirek for the first time, peeping out of the car, surrounded by a bunch of stuff. Human legs, which could easily have gone unnoticed by any random passer-by thanks to the overall chaotic composition, literally peeped out of the car, which was filled to the brim. One could only get inside through the window.

How did you meet Mirek and come up with the idea that an art project could serve as a catalyst for transforming a newly-acquired lorry into an abode and shelter for him? Why was this lorryabode ultimately only a temporary solution for him?

I met Mirek at that parking lot. I started talking to him and he told me a few things about himself, which later made me think it over more thoroughly, even though in actual fact, my understanding of his situation was merely superficial. I remembered that he had mentioned how he spends time at the local bar every day, and how the owner of that place provides him with one free daily meal. The next time I saw him there, and afterwards, I learned about many more details from his past, be it from his own personal accounts of the events, or from what the personnel of the bar told me about him. Of course, as an ever-present public figure. Mirek is a familiar face in Katowice, so it's no surprise that many people knew a thing or two about him. The idea of a lorry refurbished into a static motorhome sprang up from my wish to do something for this man. The form of the work itself is a consequence of his obsession with living in cars. Together with Mirosław, I designed the refurbished lorry and realised the project during my temporary stay in Katowice for the residency. Unfortunately, in spite of having obtained a city permit to install the object at the agreed-upon location, the lorry was removed after a short while. It turns out that during the emergence of the project, there was a dispute between the institutions that I collaborated with, which meant there was no incentive to preserve the object as part of their production, not even at another location if this one was problematic. This was something I learned about later through the grapevine. I'm afraid the final outcome is a result of the neoliberal politics of producing art merely as a means of attaining short-term goals, while completely disregarding the longterm ones, which the newly-formed institutions are inclined towards, and this definitely includes the institution mentioned above.

The video was part of an exhibition that dealt with our perception of The Other/The Foreigner, but also with how these Others see us. What's also interesting in that context is your position during the filming of the project with Mirek. Given that you had attended an artist residency in another country, and because of your artistic activities and communication with Mirek, you were seen as a foreigner, primarily by the police system. Could you explain why your presence and communication with Mirek was seen as problematic?

Yes, over time, the locals began seeing me as suspicious, and at a certain point it all escalated into a police intervention. They found it quite surprising that anyone, especially someone who doesn't speak Polish, could be spending so much time with a fellow like Mirek. Mirek and I, we spoke some kind of a Slavonic esperanto, and we understood each other guite well. One day, as I was walking through the supermarket with Mirosław, the police identified me and they said they were tipped off about me being a Ukrainian who was trying to kidnap an old man. Luckily, in the end, everything went well, and later Mirek kept remembering and laughing about the whole situation.

What this was all about is a kind of a double Otherness, we could call it that. It's about your position as a stranger in a foreign land on the one hand, and Mirek's position as a homeless man living on the margins of society, forgotten by both society and the system. R

S

Κ

99

С

Н

Α

Ν

G

Е

S Rijeka a Multicultural City?

The nationwide research into the state and issues of the minority communities in Rijeka⁴⁸, as well as Croatia as a whole, was realised as the initial activity of the Risk Change project in collaboration with Barbara Matejčić and Drago Župarić-Iljić. It was conducted during the end of 2016 and beginning of 2017, and it included desk research and field research on the topic of migration, or more precisely the immigration, inclusion and integration

of immigrants into Croatian society

and Rijeka as the city that our research subjects have chosen as their place to live. The field research was conducted in the form of a questionnaire, involving 63 subjects that have, for whatever reason, moved to Rijeka starting from the 1940s up until today. The purpose of the project was to research and explain the link between the immigrants and the locals within the process of integrating ethnic and cultural diversity.

Is Rijeka a multicultural and open city, and are its residents tolerant and ready to welcome foreigners, minorities, migrants, and refugees into their community? As a city with a strong immigrant tradition, how is Rijeka viewed by immigrants and returnees in terms of a place to live? These were some of the questions that guided the research.

The research participant sample included persons with differing life and migrant stories of their arrival in Rijeka. When it comes to the reasons for immigration, the majority was made up of the so-called economic migrants who immigrated starting from the 1940s onwards, mostly from the former Yugoslav republics in search of employment. The second-largest group was that of family migrants who came to Rijeka with their parents or to join their spouses. Some of the research subjects came from abroad in pursuit of education, and a smaller number of them came searching for security and protection, as refugees from the wars of the 1990s or as refugees from the Middle East of today.

As a summary of the research results, it is important to point out the specifics of the interviewed group of immigrants, considering the fact that, relative to the history of immigration, not all, but most of the subjects are today fully integrated into the labour market and wider social and cultural currents, which makes most of the see themselves as locals rather the migrants. Still, even though the vast majority of the subjects stated that they have been or are very much ready and willing to integrate themselves into the everyday life of the city, a third of them pointed out that in spite of their willingness, the immigrant-receiving society isn't putting enough effort into helping them make it a reality. A higher degree of criticism towards Rijeka's openness was expressed by those who

had moved here relatively recently, within this or the previous decade, and they point out institutional barriers as the crucial problem that they've had to face when dealing with, e.g. the Croatian bureaucracy. As one of the major setbacks on the path towards a better life in Rijeka, they mention the city's stagnation as they notice that it is not developing its infrastructure, industry, tourism and culture. Moreover, some immigrants from both Western and Eastern European countries view local residents as "more closed" and "more passive".

R

S

Κ

101

С

Η

Α

Ν

G

Е

Along the lines of the conclusion offe by one of the research subjects, who pointed out that Rijeka's multiculturali and openness is more a thing of the page than a real state of affairs, Matejčić and Župarić-Iljić point out: "Multiculturality as an inherited state, a reality, does not necessarily also imply an active policy, a relation and interaction that one would call multiculturalistic or interculturalistic, and that would also be valid today." Nonetheless, the interviews conducted with immigrants to Rijeka have shown that, compared to Croatia as a whole, Rijeka is still a more liberal city, accepting of diversity, but with too little practical multiculturality and with a pronounced decline in both minority and local residents.

⁴⁸ The results of the nationwide research project were published in the Risk Change reading section at the above link, in a text entitled "Rijeka as a Multicultural City: Research Results from the Project Risk Change", pp. 96-104.

The paradox of human rights – those who most need protection often encounter the greatest obstacles in getting it. Hannah Arendt

There is a great need to talk about homelessness as a pressing social issue that is not being dealt with, but is increasingly becoming a constant of capitalism. Has your temporary engagement in the sphere of homelessness through Mirek's case made the people more aware of his problem in any way, be it at the level of the community, the system or a general level? Or has Mirek faded back into oblivion upon the completion of the project?

On the contrary, his cheerful spirit made R sure that he would never be forgotten I S κ 102 С

in Katowice. The "common people", if I may call them that, never had a single issue with him: however, due to the more than obvious social differences between them, they did distance themselves from him by minimising communication. Mirek is an educated, well-mannered and conscious man with very good rhetorical abilities, which is

- why a few people have grown fond of Α
- their fellow citizen over the years, and Ν this is especially true of the lady who
- G

Н

Е

owns the bar that I mentioned earlier. I think my video can be understood as a way of documenting and shedding some light on the liveliness of the character and complexity of life of a man who is omnipresent, yet utterly marginalised in society. Mirosław is most assuredly not the only such example, so I think the video can primarily serve as a guideline that can encourage people to show more solidarity or at the very least, more empathy.

Stolen frames and the camera of resistance

Vangjush Vellahu showcased his work with a multi-channel video installation "Fragments I: Where Stories Cut Across the Land". Four video works were showcased out of a total of six that make up a series thematising the issue of unrecognised republics. The four are as follows: "Varosha - A Silent Town" (on the conflicts in The Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus), "Trans'nistria" (Republic of Moldova), "At the Edge of Tskhinvali" (Republic of South Ossetia) and "The Field of Blackbirds" (Kosovo). Vellahu points out that this is a very complicated topic involving international players whose decisions significantly affect the coexistence of these republics. In an interview about a project wherein he collected stories of people whose collective drama and war experiences remain inscribed into the buildings and landscapes that continue to bear witness to all the remnants of the past, he also spoke about his experiences during risky journeys through territories marked by conflict, closed borders and military surveillance.

What was it, which internal or external circumstances nudged you towards filming these abandoned, politically dvsrequlated states? What I mean is, merely by watching the video works, it can be safely inferred that the filming process itself was fairly complex and difficult. taking place in conflict zones. where filming is strictly prohibited. where borders have to be crossed illegally, where you are under constant army surveillance and the like. How has the filming process affected you personally?

It's hard to describe in simple terms what exactly it was that nudged me towards filming these places. I think that over time, especially after having visited and filmed in unrecognised republics, I have discovered a host of different reasons why I found these places attractive in the first place. And I think the mixed factors of feelings and memories of a place that I myself come from and of whatever is happening today with marginalised communities have become and still are inseparable. This powerful sense of belonging to a position of powerlessness and not being privileged is a feeling that takes you back to your roots. It is a feeling that does not allow you to forget your past and where you come from, no matter how far you remove yourself from the situation and change it, or how well you adjust to different cultures and perceptions. In this context, the goal was not only to research certain dysfunctional systems

and policies, but also to liberate oneself in the time and space of the past. It is a feeling that made it possible for me to feel at home. In other words. the areas of conflict and instability are the very places where I find my comfort zone. Therefore, my films are not a mere display of the struggle of certain communities condemned to unrecognition and unacceptance in our brave world/community. I also show how precisely this Other is perceived by the dominant system, as well as why the system places it into the area of the other/the inferior. At a certain level, as the man behind the camera, I find myself right in the midst of it all. Even though I also belong in this inferior position that keeps following me from the past, in the process of filming, I am neither the Other nor am I dominant. My role is that of a mere observer. At the same time. films help us perceive a dysfunctional system plagued by double standards, which was created and operated by the International community. It is a system created to serve particular interests, the privileged, and those who find

themselves in positions of power.

str. 106



Before watching your films at the MMSU exhibition. we weren't even aware of the existence of some of the countries thematised in vour films, e.g. Trans'nistria or South Ossetia. So I would say that the films possess a strong educational potential. What's more, they bring this remote, dislocated tragedy to the eves of the privileged, breaking the silence of the compromised capitalist system. What then is your actual role in the filming process as one who transfers knowledge, without taking anyone's side, approaching each of the stories from one and the same standpoint?

R

I think the tendency to establish a sort of an educational narrative was 106 inevitable, considering how many people, especially the privileged and ignorant, those fully consumed by this С

- late capitalism, really do not know Н
- these places and are not aware of the Α
- existence of certain peoples. Taking this Ν
- into account, while approaching the
- G phenomenon of unrecognised countries, Е
 - I felt a kind of responsibility to raise the general public's awareness about this issue, which is why an exclusively artistic or aesthetic approach was never an option. I don't think that not taking sides in my approach. The very fact that I decided to give voice to only one side already indicates that I did take a side. The thing is that I created a narrative around certain minority communities and people who shared their own story. For example, in Abkhazia or South Ossetia, I also had to show the Georgian side. However, within that conflict, it

is functional and fairly present in the public and political space. On the other hand, Abkhazia and South Ossetia, two separatist micronations, don't get to have that voice – and even when they do have it, it is filtered through Russian filters. Finally, my own role may be described as the role of an observer, a traveller, someone who does not know the history of these states and people, but who can experientially feel them. This feeling is what made it more comfortable for me to start conversations with the local population. Knowing how someone is feeling is definitely far more important than knowing history.

Could you also tell us a bit more about the role of the camera itself in the process of filming unrecognised territories, stricken by wars, political issues and the intense presence of borders, both physical and mental?

A sequel to the "Fragments I" series has recently been finalised, which is a two-channel video installation talking about the function of the camera from a different perspective, wherein it serves as a tool of resistance in Palestine. In the first six republics I filmed in, I used the camera as a record of certain moments and to create hitherto non-existent archives. Situations I found myself in put me in the position of a fugitive cameraman, someone who steals a certain shot - vague, shaky, at times completely void, with the aim of creating a story that has in most cases been kept secret. In my new work, a film in which I recorded the protests in Palestine,

mostly in the city of Hebron, I discovered a different function of the camera. To the Palestinians, it represents a means of peaceful resistance. This two-channel video focuses on the local organisation in Hebron, Human Rights Defenders (HRD), that launched the so-called Capture Occupation Camera Project in 2016. The project uses video documentation and the direct filming of the protests and the violence of the Israeli armed forces in order to support non-violent resistance. The HRD also deals with the production of educational workshops and the distribution of cameras in areas where the Palestinians find themselves in daily conflict with the Israelites in the West Bank, and particularly in Hebron. Thus HRD videos contain legal evidence of the constant violation of international laws and human rights by Israeli defence forces (IDF) and Israeli politics. Because of the videos filmed in the West Bank, members of the Israeli government proposed a law in 2018, which would criminalise the filming, photographing or publishing of recordings of Israeli military activities and make it punishable by up to 10 years of imprisonment. In this case therefore, the camera isn't just a mere instrument of filming, it has become a direct threat to certain military bodies and policies.

You made your films mostly by biking and walking around using a mobile phone or GoPro camera. This was not a high-level or a costly production, you made the films at your own expense and, as Maja Ćirić put it in her text, "you were free from the forms of discipline that benefit only those in power". So, instead of focusing on a high-level production, you gave more clout to the story itself, thus connecting ethics and aesthetics. which is an important moment when it comes to politically engaged and activist art. Have you ever viewed your own artwork as activist?

I'm not sure whether I can consider myself or my art as activist. In a sense. I view the art I create as a kind of obligation that I have towards society. There are moments where I feel that perhaps I should stop doing such art, because it is depressing and takes me into the obscure regions of the mind. On the other hand, I cannot seem to find the answer to the question of what else I could/should be doing. I seem to be defined by my art. In principle, I don't think my starting point is an activist one, even though, indirectly, I suppose that it can be described as some abstract form of activism. Ultimately, my role is the role of the narrator. someone who feels the need to express himself in a specific way. If there is a story, especially an important and significant story, that needs to be told, production-level is most assuredly not a priority.

...in the Early Modern Age, as paradoxical as it sounds, Europe was often more open to encounters with the Other than it is today. Dragan Markovina POLICIA

PO-



Anti-fascism as a solidarity practice and politics : MILENA OSTOJÍ

- I
- **B** In May this year, in the midst of
- **E** U.S. protests sparked by the police
- **R** assassination of George Floyd, the
- A U.S. president, presumably from an
- **T** underground bunker where he was
- **E** taken after protesters dangerously

112

liberal provenance media have once
 again set out in search of experts who
 will explain to the general public what

ł

Α

pronunciation) is. American historian Mark Bray, whose, by his own admission, unabashedly partisan book "Antifa: The Anti-Fascist Handbook" was published⁴⁹ three years earlier, at the time of the riots in Charlottesville and the neo-Nazi assassination of an anti-fascist protester

Heather Hayer. The book defines the

exactly, pardon the expression, an-tee-

fuh (as they regularly educate on the

subject anti-fascism, depending on the context, as "as a kind of ideology, an identity, a tendency or milieu, or an activity of self-defence". Although Antifa is not simply a negation of (historical) fascism, for an anti-fascist (counter) organization it is crucial as it defines fascism⁵⁰.

The Centre for Peace Studies (CMS) recently pointed out the tendencies to criminalize solidarity within the European Union's legislative framework, which in its formal and informal forms⁵¹ includes disciplinary measures, discouragement and intimidation of activists and organizations providing solidarity aid to asylum seekers. According to, for example, the 2002 "Facilitators Package", the directive and the accompanying decision, which establishes a legal framework to combat illegal immigration, the definition of human trafficking omits the motive of financial gain. This, in contrast to a much more specific and legally superior protocol by the United Nations against human trafficking, blurs the difference between smuggling and aiding, and individual states are left with great authority in deciding on the possible persecution of organizations and activists, as well as anyone who offers someone a glass of water without the proper documents. So far, the various forms of intimidation and discipline specifically include calls for intelligence interviews or retaliation of another kind. After Are You Syrious and CMS documented and reported documented police beatings at borders, as well as violent and illegal pushbacks, for nine months the Ministry of the Interior denied them access to the Porin asylum seekers' shelter in Zagreb and disabled their work on the integration of children through educational programs, the provision of legal aid and other solidarity activities. Last year, the European NGO openDemocracy reported⁵² that hundreds of people across Europe, with the number of people growing from year to year. were detained and arrested and charged with "facilitating illegal immigration" for mere acts of human solidarity: a German Protestant pastor who allowed a group of Sudanese refugees to spend the night on church premises, a 72-year-old retired French

Anti-fascism, independent publishing and working-class food

Kitchen of Diversity joins the City of Rijeka and the Association of Anti-Fascist Fighters and Anti-Fascists of Primorje-Gorski Kotar County in commemorating the 74th anniversary of Rijeka Liberation Day with the international cultural programme Liberated Rijeka. The programme is centred on the topic of antifascism, the fundamental value of united Europe, and commemorates the sacrifice of the Yugoslav Partisan fighters and one of the most difficult World War II liberation battles in this part of Europe, which took place on 3 May 1945.

This concert of local, regional and international choirs brings to the fore the rich heritage of partisan, anti-fascist, revolutionary and libertarian songs, as well as various practices of activist selforganisation. The discursive programme reveals the forms and effects of modern fascism and provides strategies of resistance. The exhibition of radical magazines and fanzines from the collection of Giovanni Morbini was accompanied by a discussion with the editors and journalists of cult youth and independent media, such as Arkzin, Val, Zin Zin and Slobodni Filozofski, which focused on youth, independent publishing and anti-fascism. All of this was spiced up with a public cooking event entitled Working-Class

Food for the Civic Palate.

Bray, Mark. Antifa: Anti-fascist Handbook. New York: Melville House, 2017.

 ⁵⁰ Matić, Luka. "'Građanski antifašizam' na braniku Tudmanove Hrvatske." Slobodni Filozofski, internet edition, 13 November 2018, accessed on 26 August 2020. http://slobodnifilozofski.com/2018/11/gradanski-antifasizambraniku-tudmanove-hrvatske.html
 ⁵¹ 6. (characterizational states and s

⁵¹ Ćuća, Ana. Criminalisation of solidarity (Policy brief). CMS, website, 2019. https://www.cms.hr/system/article_document/doc/616/CPS_Policy_brief_Criminalisation_of_solidarity.pdf

⁵² Archer, Nandini; Torrisi, Claudia; Provost, Claire; Nabert, Alexander; Lobos, Belen. "Hundreds of Europeans 'criminalised' for helping migrants – as far right aims to win big in Europeanelections." *openDemocracy*, 18 May 2019, accessed on 26 August 2020. https://www.opendemocracy. net/en/5050/hundreds-of-europeans-criminalised-for-helpingmigrants-new-data-shows-as-far-right-aims-to-win-big-ineuropean-elections/

teacher who took a 15-year-old boy and a young woman from Nice to Antibes or a mountain guide who helped a pregnant Nigerian woman cross the Italian-French border in the Alps.

For this, it is important to remember what the Hungarian philosopher Gáspár Miklós Tamás analyses as post-fascism. According to him, the most important feature of fascism is "the reversal of the Enlightenment's tendency for citizenship (citovenneté) to merge with the condition of the human (conditio *humana*)."⁵³ Simply put, within the tendencies of the Enlightenment, the republic and progressive movements and thinkers (political liberalism, socialism, communism), if political rights or participation in the political community were to be extended (although within the limits of the state as a guarantor of political rights) to all, fascism would respond by formulating "lower species" and "racial laws" that categorize people by separating the citizen from the noncitizen. Tamás calls the new forms of social segregation post-fascist. Through a set of "policies, practices, routines and ideologies", they restrict access to civil rights using a technocraticpolice medium; post-fascist societies

have no need for an official ideology

institutionalized at the supranational

of racial superiority, systemic racism is

L

I

В

Ε

R

Α

Т

Ε

D

114

R

L

J

Е

Κ

Α

level.

Those who do not enjoy citizenship status, i.e. those that do not have official residency or papers, "illegal immigrants", outlawed, are legally and administratively dehumanized. After they cross the EU border, if they can cross it in the first place, their very existence and lives get criminalized. Although it does not exclude what we might call extreme right-wing and neofascist forms of discourse and practice, post-fascism has no need for mass movement or mobilization - moreover, a mass of apolitical and disinterested, "depoliticized private individuals"⁵⁴ alone is enough as they are the ideal recipients of political propaganda on security threats and terrorism, as well as further dehumanization carried out by the media with shameful reports regarding the "hunt for migrants". This silent and administrative criminalization of solidarity also has a historical function and plays the role of fascism in breaking up the trade union and workers' movement of class solidarity in postfascist societies. German activist and captain Carola Rackete, for example, as well as Pia Klemp, captain of the "Iuventa" ship who, along with a ninemember crew, faces a sentence of twenty years in prison for the "crime" of rescuing thousands of people from certain death in the Mediterranean Sea, "the deadliest border in the world".

Historical revisionism

On 19 September 2019, the European Parliament passed a resolution called, ironically⁵⁵, the resolution on the "importance of European remembrance for the future of Europe" (2019/2819(RSP)). This time, at the initiative of conservative MEPs from the former Eastern Bloc. and with the blessing of Western Member States, European political elites ventured into a bizarre historical falsification that World War II "began as a direct result of the infamous Nazi-Soviet Nonaggression Pact of 23 August 1939, also known as the Molotov-Ribbentrop Pact, and its secret protocols, in which these two totalitarian regimes, with the common goal of conquering the world, divided Europe into two zones of influence". This is the last in a series of institutional translations "practically unusable for historiography and social sciences"⁵⁶, the so-called "thesis of two totalitarianisms" which. as Enzo Traverso shows. first developed in the Cold War kitchen and, although defeated in the academic debate of the 1980s (*Historikerstreit*⁵⁶), would win a political victory due to the altered geopolitical circumstances after the fall of the Berlin Wall and the proclamation of "the end of history".



[🕨] str. 118

⁵³ Tamás, Gáspár Miklós. "On Post-fascism". *Boston Review,* internet edition, 1 June 2000, accessed on 26 August 2020. http://bostonreview.net/world/g-m-tamas-post-fascism

⁵⁴ Krašovec, Primož. "Evropska politika i (neo)fašizam". Stvar – časopis za teorije prakse, no. 8, Novi Sad: Gerusija, 2016, pp. 42-53.

 ⁵⁵ Švraka, Danijel. "Fašizam i kultura zaborava". *Slobodni Filozofski*, internet edition, 6 August 2016, accessed
 on 28 August 2020. http://slobodnifilozofski.com/2016/08/fasizam-kultura-zaborava.html

 ⁵⁶ Traverso, Enzo. "Totalitarizam. Povijest i aporije koncepta". *Slobodni Filozofski*, internet edition, 12 April
 ⁵⁷ 2018, accessed on 26 August 2020. http://slobodnifilozofski.com/2018/04/totalitarizam-povijest-aporije-koncepta.html
 ⁵⁷ Traverso, Enzo. *The New Anti-Communism: Rereading the Twentieth Century*. History and Revolution: Refuting

Revisionism (Ed. Haynes, Mike; Wolfreys, Jim). London – New York: Verso, 2007.



The thesis of two totalitarianisms actually constructs its own position of "post-political innocence", often depoliticizing the historical conflict of anti-fascism and fascism through the victimization paradigm, thus delegitimizing the whole historical experience, "subsequently erasing from memory the whole drama of that communism, its historical internal struggles, reversals, different often mutually opposing phases (...) All these differences, both within time and within space, were subsequently erased and summarized in the form of a single experience, the experience of totalitarianism."58 On the European continent, its function is to complete the destruction of the political imagination and to delegitimize in advance the solidarity and egalitarian alternatives to capitalism.

L

Т

В

Ε

R

Α

Т

Е

D

118

The resolution was readily supported by R all six Croatian MEPs present, including,

- as expected, three SDP and IDS MEPs. Т
- J In our domestic version, in a country
- that, together with other Yugoslav Е
- peoples, liberated itself from fascism Κ
- through the national liberation struggle, Α and then undertook a comprehensive post-war reconstruction of the country and socialist modernization on an egalitarian basis. the discourse of "two totalitarianisms" serves as a creeping rehabilitation of the Ustasha movement through the normalization of the 'ZDS' ('For

the homeland - ready') greeting, as well as silencing and disputing the legacy of the anti-fascist struggle and socialist revolution: mass literacy, gender emancipation. secularization, infrastructure construction and economic democratization embodied in attempts to organize selfgoverning socialism. The famous "anti-fascism in the Constitution" through the decisions of ZAVNOH (State Anti-fascist Council for the National Liberation of Croatia) in the original basis already harnessed in the nationalist teleology of the millennial dream of an independent Croatian state, which again produces all those eminently SDP "defences" of antifascism according to which it is. after all. good for Croatia because it brought it to the "winning side" of the Second World War at the last minute or provided it with the current territorial scope. We should also add the Catholic Church. which infrastructurally, materially and ideologically supports most revisionist aces, with the considerable help of publicly funded television, which also hosts blatant deniers of genocide and the Holocaust. A special place is occupied by the revisionist efforts of ultraconservative organizations which, in addition to aggressive anti-communism and attacks on sexual, gender and national minorities, are emphasised via their official and representative portals with invectives and insults against the

"arrogant" Giordano Bruno. "sickly obsessed with his own greatness", on the 417th anniversary of his death at the stake.

The mentioned tension between the proclaimed anti-fascism with a suppressed social component and the capitalist logic crucially determined by the revisionist conjuncture is especially evident in Istria and Rijeka, which are often seen by the rest of the country as "red" enclaves of anti-fascism. Namely, as Emil Jurcan from the Pula cooperative "Praksa" showed in 2013⁵⁹, through the cultural identity of Istrianism, branded as anti-fascist, multinational and regional,⁶⁰ further clientelist privatization and liberalization are propagated with material and existential discipline of dissonant media and civil society actors. Furthermore, how anti-fascist values and solidarity collide with profit motive and capitalist logic was best expressed by the IDS, again, commenting in 2015 on the idea of arranging shelters for refugees in former military facilities, stating that "it is absurd that of all possible locations in Croatia for refugee centres, what is mentioned is the real estate that has huge investment potential". On the other hand, the statements made by Rijeka's spurious cultural leaders that the transformation of Tito's ship "Galeb" into a museum will be in the function of a critical re-examination of how

"all three totalitarianisms" are equally symptomatic.⁶¹

Grassroots initiatives

So, what would be anti-fascism on the periphery of the EU today? In the shelter of two or three totalitarianisms, with police thugs at the borders and already fully legitimized decent debates between "middle-aged men with ties", to paraphrase a line from BoJack Horseman⁶², about women's rights to bodily autonomy and reproductive self-determination? In the past decade, grassroots initiatives have emerged as as efforts to breathe into anti-fascism through collective practice content that unites class resistance against increasingly acute social inequalities, widely understood solidarity and specific minority struggles with a broader international perspective. Antifascist political (self)education about the historical and material conditions of the creation of fascism also implies social translation between global and local problems on the periphery of Europe and the semi-periphery of capitalism: for example, awareness of police

61 Lasić, Igor. "E moj galebe". *Novosti,* website, 30 April 2017, accessed on 28 August 2020. https://www.portalnovosti.com/e-moj-galebe
 BoJack Horseman, American animated series for adults, S03E06, Pew Pew, Netflix, 2016.

Buden, Boris; Hrnjez, Saša. "Što je manje komunizma, to je više antikomunizma". Lupiqa, internet edition, 17 March, accessed on 26 August 2020. https://lupiga.com/intervjui/intervju-boris-buden-sto-je-manje-komunizma-to-jevise-antikomunizma

⁵⁹ Jurcan, Emil. Istarski pristanak. Forme represije u multikulturnom društvu. Zadruga Praksa, internet edition, ²⁰ December 2013, accessed on 26 August 2020. https://praksa.hr/istra/#title
 ⁶⁰ Cf. Baradić, Marta. "Istra: sprega kulture i turizma". *Bilten*, internet edition, 6 May 2020, accessed on 26 August 2020.

https://www.bilten.org/?p=32525



beatings of refugees fleeing imperialist wars and climate change or recognition of gender and labour exploitation and the oppression of sexual minorities advocated by the ideologically imported ultra-conservative associations of the new generation through their programs and activities. Then the insights from the analysis of historical revisionism, in the time of hegemony in which we live, according to which historical revisionism never stops simply at relativizing the victory over fascism and delegitimizing the communist movement and other actors who carried the anti-fascist struggle and socialist revolution, but its purpose is to liquidate the entire revolutionary tradition and two centuries of emancipatory struggles and demands for equality from women, slaves and workers.

Continuing in some way on the democratic impulse of social mobilizations for free education and public goods from the previous decade, and further experimentation with direct democratic methods, antifascist initiatives are determined by the dynamics of the area of civil society, trade unions and the media, which includes the development of more functional trade unions from smaller or branch unions, as well as new forms of cooperatives and the emergence of new left and left-liberal non-profit media. In the context of education, we should also mention, among other things, research papers on the practices of the the Women's Antifascist Front of the Sarajevo Association for Art and Culture Red ("Udruženja za umjetnost i kulturu Crvena") and Zagreb's Centre for Women's Studies and the organization of illegal Zagreb as part of the "The Anti-fascist Newspaper" ("Kartografije otpora"), as well as the project "Heritage from below / Drežnica: Traces and Memories 1941 - 1945" ("Baština odozdo / Drežnica: Tragovi i sjećanja 1941. - 1945."). The Blok is organizing a "Political School for Artists and All Those Interested", and the Female Anti-fascists Network Zagreb (MAZ) in cooperation with the Serb National Council (SNV) is organizing an Antifa Camp in Srb. The anti-fascist newspaper also specializes in dealing with revisionist forgeries, and the Belgrade initiative "Say No to Rehabilitation" ("Ne rehabilitaciji") consistently unmasks a specific variant of revisionism as the one that is in force in Serbia. The diversion actions of Antifa Šibenik, on the other hand, defend the colours of Dalmatia, and with the organization of the Festival of the Alternative Left FALIŠ, the Museum of Victory was opened in that city at the instigation of a very active local association of anti-fascist fighters and anti-fascists.

Mark Bray notes that anti-fascist activism has at least two important tasks. First and foremost, it means preventing rightwing and racist organizations, as well as solidarity protection and support for those who cannot defend themselves. In addition to the huge involvement of *Are You Syrious* and CMS in the segment of integration and assistance for refugees and migrants, the collective Joint Action "Roof over Heads" ("Krov nad glavom") from Serbia should also be mentioned. They defend tenants in an organized manner from evictions from a single home, also with increasingly serious threats of criminalization of solidarity⁶³. An example of consistent anti-fascist activity is the party Radnička fronta (Worker's Front) with engagements ranging from leading demonstrations in Bleiburg, Austria, against the rightwing commemoration of the Ustasha defeat at the end of Second World War to a protest action of tearing the razor wire at the border between Croatia and Slovenia, or protests against the anti-Roma demonstrations in Čakovec, and to the years-long support for organizing the resistance of the workers of the Pula shipyard against its liquidation or reprivatisation.

Another equally important task of anti-fascism is to **build a society** and community that, especially in times of crisis and social turmoil, will be immune to the "call of fascism", resistant to xenophobia, racism, misogyny, transphobia and homophobia and other forms of oppression and exploitation. The anti-fascist construction of a society also implies the conquest of new public spaces and the struggle for the possibility of direct political socialization and articulation of the individual through collective action. In addition to the struggle for

R

Е

Κ

Α

L

В

Е

R

Α

Т

Е

D

commons and the conquest of public spaces is the Zagreb Pride Parade, organized since 2002 by the queer, the feminist and anti-fascist association Zagreb Pride, which, with strong police protection and constant chauvinistic threats of violence, conquers the city's streets, making both trans people and migrants feel safe. The Split parade has been proudly marching since 2011, the March 8th Night March of the feminist collective fAKTIV has been held since 2016, and since 2018 the Citizens of Rijeka initiative ("Građanke i građani Rijeke"), which units several civil society

L

I

В

Ε

R

organizations, is organizing a "Walk for Freedom", a counter-demonstration against the ultraconservative march to restrict women's reproductive rights, which was also held in 2020 in Sisak. Anti-fascists organizing the painting over of graffiti calling for racial and national hatred is also a contribution to the struggle for open and inclusive public spaces. MAZ, on the other hand, leads the Solidarity March, an annual walk which, in cooperation with other trade unions, feminists, minorities and other progressive initiatives, warns of specific problems of deindustrialization and the position of workers, revisionism and attacks on women's reproductive rights, and calls for solidarity with refugees and Romani people. In 2015, it renewed the Trnje Bonfires. NK Zagreb's anti-fascist fans, "Bijeli anđeli", and other antifascist associations founded NK Zagreb 041, a directly democratically organized football club that, like the self-organized "Domaćigosti" choir, is dedicated to working with refugees and fighting xenophobia. Other, mostly female, choirs, such as "Le Zbor", "ZborXop" and "Zbor Praksa" should also be mentioned, each with its own specific activist accent and choice of repertoire.

"I don't see sea rescue as a humanitarian action, but as part of an anti-fascist fight," said Pia Klemp, who refused the City of Paris award for her "humanitarian work" last year, pointing to the city administration's hypocrisy persecuting the homeless and criminalizing solidarity activists "within its walls" and emphasising the difference between solidarity and humanitarianism: solidarity is action, side by side, among equals. Anti-fascism is a requirement for the transformation of society on an egalitarian and solidarity basis. ■





The Port of Diversity in public policies

LELA VVJANIĆ

D

Т

V

Ε

R

Μ

- ongoing Kitchen of Diversity programmes, L such as RoUm, The Fifth Ensemble and the
- Х Porto Etno festival, or others within the
- Ε ECoC project such as the 27 Neighbourhoods

The Diversity Mixer – Policies and Practices

in Cultural and Creative Industries project

flagship of Rijeka 2020 – European Capital

of Culture. Together with our partners, we

wanted to be active not only in the domain

of producing cultural and artistic content,

where we would be reflecting on our own

guidelines and recommendations that can

serve as a signpost for other stakeholders

in the sector. Our guide in this endeavour

of Diversity, as we wanted to incorporate

this diversity into the existing policies and

was the slogan of Rijeka 2020, *The Port*

practices used to manage it. Numerous

but also in the field of cultural policies,

practices, but also devising structural

sprang up from the *Kitchen of Diversity*

and the Children's House flagships,⁶⁴ have R already made this diversity more visible in practical terms. Of course, there is also a much wider array of existing initiatives, actions and collective experiments⁶⁵ that appear in Croatia and the rest of Europe, particularly from the 1990s onwards, in the segments of socially engaged or participatory art, as well as community art where other,

under-represented and vulnerable social groups participate on equal terms alongside artists and cultural workers.

The situation has never been great when it comes to the financing or, even more so, the recognition of such projects. This is the result of several related facts and trends in recent Croatian cultural policy:

diversity has not been recognised as a quality to strive for, nor is it evident from the existing strategic documents what its actual contribution in the domestic

context is.⁶⁶ Such projects and programmes are most often positioned in the social domain of culture where they become marginalised, and not priority aims of calls for tenders that evaluate artistic value and quality. The past three decades of Croatian cultural policy mostly emphasized the commercial and professional aspect of the sector, while at the same time intentionally interrupting or at the very least leaving unmentioned the possible continuity with the periods of inclusive Yugoslav cultural policy and its resulting cultural and artistic production⁶⁷.

The last decade has seen a growing number of such socially engaged programmes which include the other, the different, and the differently abled. Many, and among them the above mentioned, have only recently found their place under the sun and have been recognised as an important part of contemporary socio-cultural production, thanks to their complexity and scope and the established local, regional, national and European collaborations and financial mechanisms within the ECoC project as well as the orientation of its programmes⁶⁸.

Our goal with Diversity Mixer has been to make sure not only that the very programmes we initiated, which were to a significant extent dedicated to diversity in production, content or audiences, become the theme of existing "public needs in culture", but that they also initiate the creation of new activities within the system of local self-government, as well as new lines of financing at local, regional and national levels. We also wanted to learn from our own trials and errors, and provide a handbook, or perhaps a recipe outlining the best practices for anyone and everyone interested in the topics of diversity and inclusiveness.

From cooking ingredients

The strictest sense of diversity, which is also the most concrete and most relevant for the Croatian context. is based on values of inclusiveness or the absence of any form of discrimination. Diversity as a concept, a

policy, and a set of practices and criteria, was implemented in the corporate sector a long time ago as part of the diversity & inclusion policies, which in practical terms means that it was precisely this wealth of differences where the liberal-corporate management of diversity has found a way to boost its developmental potential and absorb all the groups and identities in the various niches of market targets, i.e. target groups. All nondominant identities are welcome, as they represent individual market niches, expand the pool and number of consumers and, in order to ensure the best possible placement of services and communications with these consumers, non-dominant identities are also needed among the employees.

In contrast with such an approach, which is primarily dedicated to the creation of consumers, at *Diversity Mixer* we were guided by the principles of cultural production aimed at creating a citizen, along with all the rights and competences that this citizenship entails. Culture is the key "tool" for building a social subject that speaks with his or her own voice and takes part in social and cultural (re)production on a level playing field.

So far, we primarily understood diversity, which is a relatively unfamiliar concept in national and local considerations of cultural policy, present merely as a convenient buzzword in European reflections, and partly present in the related concept of participation in culture, as relevant to the realm of producers.

127

66 Time and Risk Produce Quality. Rijeka: Rijeka 2020, 2019.

str. 130

Since the mentioned programmes, described in more detail at rijeka2020.eu, are dedicated to the promotion of diversity and enhancing participation in culture, the content these programmes provide is created by Rijeka's national minorities, children, the Roma, persons with developmental disabilities, local communities in the rural areas of the Primorje-Gorski Kotar County etc.

⁶⁵ See, for example, Montažstroj, Potrošeni/55+.

https://rijeka2020.eu/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/Vrijeme-i-rizik-proizvode-kvalitetu.pdf

⁶⁷ Examples of such production from the past, socialist era are the Earth Collective (Kolektiv Zemlja) and the numerous programmes of the Sisak Ironworks, particularly the concept of the Artist in associated labour (Umjetnik u udruženom radu). Rijeka 2020 – Port of Diversity Bid Book, Chapter 5, Outreach.

https://rijeka2020.eu/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/ri2020-eng-web.pdf

Diversity management in the cultural and creative industries

The Diversity Mixer – Policies and Practices in the Cultural and Creative Industries project aims to foster diversity in the production of the cultural and creative industries of Primorje-Gorski Kotar County. *Diversity Mixer* explores diversity in the cultural and creative industries and engages neglected authors, content and audiences. Through this project, together with its strategic partner the Academy of Applied Arts / University of Rijeka and its associated partner the Croatian Business Council for Sustainable Development (Zagreb), Rijeka 2020 wants to further establish the notion of "diversity" used in its slogan, both in the workplace, i.e. the structure of employees, and the content they produce, as well as in the audiences they address. It is financially supported by the EU Rights, Equality and Citizenship Programme 2014 -2020. During 2019, the project explored the existing "diversity management" practices in the public and private sector of the cultural and creative industries on the local and European level and identified transferable models. The international conference Invisibles: Diversity in Culture and the Creative Industries, which deals with diversity, was also held as a part of the project.

The year 2020 will see the implementation of capacity building activities for workers in organisations and companies, with the goal of influencing the process of public policymaking and incorporating new criteria into the system of public financing. In October 2020, the City of Rijeka, institutions and cultural organisations in Rijeka and Primorje-Gorski Kotar County will sign the Diversity Charter.



With broadening horizons

This publication is also a part of the *Diversity Mixer* project, intended to be a continuation of the Handbook, containing practical examples, i.e. concrete artistic, cultural and activist programmes that have already made diversity more visible during the three years of *Kitchen* in Rijeka. However, all the recipes that we have prepared, including those from the documentation of the entire project,⁷⁴ are neither easily implemented nor all-powerful. They are not implemented in a vacuum in the same way that a diverse, inclusive and supportive cultural and artistic practice and cultural policy cannot exist in and of itself. separate from other practices and policies. Without an equivalent political and economic framework, such a practice exists merely as a "temporary zone", which is as fragile and vulnerable as its many participants, i.e. producers, which is something that we have painfully experienced as the consequences of the COVID-19 pandemic which affected the entire CCI sector, as well as the ECoC project itself.

The return to the questions of labour, its price, of job and social security, relations of production, collaborations, supportive and inclusive relations has only during the pandemic become a key issue for the cultural sector and the wider political and economic formulations of the new normal. Even though the appeals to save the sector⁷⁴ do not deal with diversity in particular, but with the structural prerequisites of cultural production, its maintenance and sustained protection, diversity cannot be theorised nor established in practice in a vacuum made up of atomised professionals/producers separate from each other by relations of competition in the best-case scenario and of mere survival in the worst-case scenario. Diversity can also not be implemented in a cultural and artistic practice, atomised to its own space, outside of the wider space of socio-economic struggles and relations and without the other, disenfranchised groups. It is only this wider, common horizon, which is explicitly present in the Appeal, that will enable a conception of diversity which will be different from the one coming from the liberal management of diversity. This is a good place to take note of the continued discussion that exists within the field of engaged art, which also appeared in our research as point of discord among its stakeholders, and which is taking place within the dichotomies of ethics and aesthetics, art and activism, artistic guality and social inclusiveness⁷⁶. Some theoreticians and researchers emphasize the numerous positive social effects of art, while others view this overemphasising of the social function of culture as a threat to art itself. In the Diversity Mixer project we have developed, and hopefully proven the hypothesis that it is only through the inclusion of the other and different, and through connecting and

overcoming these dichotomies, that we can vouch for the survival and sustainability of cultural and artistic production and that this inclusion is the necessary signpost in the much-needed, pandemicaccelerated reformulation of the tenets of the entire sector.

The inherent clash within the very concept of cultural and creative industries, which seemed insurmountable in some phases of our work, a clash between the part of CCIs that belongs to the public and the non-profit sector, and the part that belongs to the private and profit sector, which is also enhanced by the pandemic, ultimately resulted in choosing a clear focus on culture as a public good that needs to be supported, nurtured and developed primarily through the system of public financing in cooperation with other public sectors such as education. The "Culture of care", mentioned by the authors of the handbook, for a secure, free and regular access to art can only manifest itself within the system of the public and the non-profit.

Instead of the hyper-production of events and material objects, further commercialisation and maintaining an artificial sustainability through ticketing, we need a sustainable system of culture and creative industries, built on both intra-, and intersectoral collaborations, but primarily in cooperation with the citizens, on relations of trust and solidarity, on activities and programmes that encourage creativity and foster social change. That is why we see this publication and the entire *Diversity Mixer* project as merely the starting point of reflections on the new cultural policy, primarily at the level of the City of Rijeka, but also on the national level, where the focus should be on extending the democratic horizon of culture—the issue of diversity and participation in culture relative to the producers—to the content they produce and to the audience they address.

R

D

L

V

Ε

R

S

L

т

Υ

135

⁷⁴ The Diversity Mixer project documentation is available at the following link https://rijeka2020.eu/projekti/eu-projekti/diversity-mixer/

⁷⁵ The Appeal of the Platform for Working Conditions in Culture Za K.R.U.H. and of the Enough with the cuts already! initiative is available at http://www.blok.hr/hr/vijesti/apel-platforme-za-radne-uvjete-u-kulturi

⁷⁶ Bishop, Claire. Artificial Hells: Participatory Art and the Politics of Spectatorship. London: Verso, 2012.



The Kitchen Team:

Partners



Nemanja Cvijanović

Domagoj Kučinić

Ana Fabijanić

Jelena Tondini

Lela Vujanić

AND many other individual artists, cultural workers and informal initiatives

Porto Etno – Festival of World Music and Gastronomy

Rijeka Italian Community Serbian Cultural Society "Prosvjeta" – Rijeka Subcommittee National Community of Montenegrins of

Rijeka

Cultural Society of Rusyns and Ukrainians "Rušnjak" of Primorje-Gorski Kotar County Russian Home - the Russian National Minority Association in Primorje-Gorski Kotar County Association of Slovaks in Rijeka Albanian Association of Primorje-Gorski Kotar County Albanian Association of the island of Krk Macedonian Cultural Society "Ilinden" Democratic Union of Hungarians in Primorje-Gorski Kotar County "Češka Beseda" Rijeka Slovenian House - "Bazovica" Cultural and **Educational Society** Association of the Peoples' Communities of Bosnia and Herzegovina **Bosniak National Community** "SEVDAH" Culture and Arts Society Rijeka expats – Trinidad and Tobago, Madagascar, India, Philippines, United States of America Addiction Help NGO VIDA Rijeka Centre for Rehabilitation Zoran Majstorović, music programme manager

Srđana Jevtić, gastro programme manager

SMOQUA – Festival of Feminist and Queer Culture

Lesbian Organisation Rijeka LORI PaRiter Human Rights and Civic Participation Association

From the Citizens to their City Initiative Centre for Women's Studies at the Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences in Rijeka

Festival of the European Short Story and The Hay Festival

Croatian Writers Society – HDP Hay Festival Foundation (Hay-on-Wye, UK) University of Rijeka, Academy of Applied Arts

Review of Small Literatures

Association for the promotion of cultures -Kulturtreger

RoUm

ProPuh, social innovation company Roma Youth Organization of Croatia

Fifth Ensemble

Croatian National Theatre Ivan pl. Zajc, Rijeka **Rijeka Centre for Care and Education** Rijeka 21 - Down Syndrome Association

Liberated Rijeka

The City of Rijeka Association of Anti-Fascist Fighters and Anti-Fascists of Primorje-Gorski Kotar County

Furioza

Club Crkva NGO Diston Tipsy **Rijeka Pensioners' Association**

Diversity Mixer

University of Rijeka, Academy of Applied Arts Croatian Business Council for Sustainable Development

Risk Change

Museum of Modern and Contemporary Art, Rijeka

Unreal Cities

Creative Laboratory of Contemporary Theatre KRILA

Migrants Day

OKC Palach Art-kino Croatia

0 0 Κ Е D

W

н

0

139

С

www.rijeka2020.eu 51 000 Rijeka Ivana Grohovca 1a RIJEKA 2020 d.o.o. Seveds!

:eðevebzi eZ

Irena Kregar Segota

- Urednica:
- d **SingluV sla** Μ
- :inotuA

S

Э

Я

- volutnA sésteN
- Π **Ivna Franić**
- 140 Marina Tkalčić Ν **SiloteO sneliM**
- **SinsiuV** slad Franko Dota Dunja Matić Benčić Tamara Puhovski Hajrudin Hromadzić

Redaktura:

Sive9 eniloreX

S00

Tisak:

Naklada:

Suradnica:

Betty Stojnić

Sara Pavičić

Gabriela Jozić

voleS enitreM

Boris Kanazir

Sirola Sirola

Karlo Cargonja

Damir Zižić

Drazen Sokcevic

Stephany Stefan **Borko Vukosav**

Nirvana Ziško

Dizajn, prijelom i naslovnica:

Tanja Kanazir

Fotografije:

Edi Matić

Kerschoffset, Zagreb

Alkemist Studio d.o.o.

Lucija Polonijo

Lektura i prijevod:

141112030. CIP zapis dostupan u računalnom katalogu Sveučilišne knjižnice Rijeka pod brojem rujan 2020.

9-6-69287-296-826 NBSI

u sklopu projekta Rijeka 2020 – Europska prijestolnica kulture. Zbornik je nastao kroz programski pravać Kuhinja različitosti

Publisher: **RIJEKA 2020 d.o.o.** Ivana Grohovca 1a 51 000 Rijeka www.rijeka2020.eu

For the publisher: Irena Kregar Šegota

Editor:

Lela Vujanić

Μ Ρ

R

140

Authors:

Nataša Antulov

- Ν
- Ivna Franić Т
 - Milena Ostojić Marina Tkalčić Hairudin Hromadžić Tamara Puhovski Dunja Matić Benčić **Franko Dota** Lela Vujanić

Editing:

Karolina Pavić

ISBN 978-953-48369-9-6

September 2020 The CIP record is available in the computer catalog of the University of Rijeka Library under number 141112030.

This anthology was created within the Kitchen of Diversity flagship

of the Rijeka 2020 – European Capital of Culture project.

Print run: 200

Printed by: Kerschoffset, Zagreb

Associate: Lucija Polonijo

Proofreading and translation: Alkemist Studio d.o.o.

Damir Žižić Ištvan Širola Karlo Čargonja **Boris Kanazir** Edi Matić Martina Šalov Gabriela Jozić Sara Pavičić **Betty Stojnić**

Photographs: Tanja Kanazir **Borko Vukosav Stephany Stefan** Dražen Šokčević

Design, layout and cover: Nirvana Žiško